

The Council of the City of Centerville, County of Montgomery, State of Ohio, met on Monday, February 15, 2016, at 7:30 P.M. in the Council Chambers of the Centerville Municipal Building. The Meeting was opened with an Invocation given by Dee Huff, First Reader at the First Church of Christ, Scientist, and the Pledge of Allegiance. Mayor Compton shared information about presidents and Presidents' Day in honor of the date. Councilmembers and City Staff were present as follows:

Deputy Mayor Belinda Kenley
 Councilmembers John Beals
 Mark Engert
 John Palcher
 JoAnne Rau
 Bill Serr

Interim Clerk of Council Julia Weaver
 City Manager Gregory Horn
 Finance Director Steven Hinshaw
 City Planner Andrew Rodney
 Public Works Director Doug Spitler
 City Engineer Jim Brinegar
 Economic Development Director Nathan Cahall
 Human Resources Manager Jennifer Wilder
 Assistant to the City Manager Kristen Gopman
 Community Resources Coordinator Maureen Russell Hodgson
 Municipal Attorney Scott Liberman

The minutes of the following meetings had been distributed prior to this meeting:

Council Meeting	January 25, 2016.
Work Session Meetings	January 25, 2016. February 8, 2016.

Mr. Beals made a motion for approval of the minutes, as distributed. Mrs. Rau seconded the motion. The motion passed 7-0 with Mrs. Kenley abstaining from the vote on the work session minutes of February 8, 2016.

Mrs. Weaver announced the receipt of an email from Mr. Raj Grandhi, requesting that consideration of Application P-2015-0039, Item One of the report of the Planning Commission, be tabled to the March meeting. Mr. Serr made a motion to remove Application P-2015-0039, the Preliminary Development Plan for the Villas of Centerville, from the table. Mr. Palcher seconded the motion. The motion passed 7-0. Mr. Beals made a motion to table consideration of Mr. Grandhi's application to the meeting on March 21, 2016. Mrs. Kenley seconded the motion. The motion passed 7-0.

Mayor Compton welcomed Coach Dave Dobson and the Centerville Girls Cross Country Team to be recognized for an outstanding season. After winning top honors at the state and regional level, the team placed eleventh at the Nike Nationals in Portland, Oregon, in December. Mr. Engert read a certificate congratulating Lainey Studebaker, Taylor Malchow, Kelli Walsh,

Grace Kilroy, Savannah Lowe, Rachel Whitehead, Allison Fick, Laura Drew, and Sophie Hippenmeyer for their exceptional accomplishments.

Kristen Dintaman, 3350 Federalist Drive, Kettering, gave a presentation for Relay for Life. This fundraising event for the American Cancer Society will be at Centerville High School on May 4 and 5, 2016, from 2 p.m. to 8 a.m.

In the Mayor's Report, Mr. Compton acknowledged the snow removal efforts of the Public Works Department and commended Public Works Director Doug Spitler. The Mayor also thanked the Arts Commission, Ms. Strausburg, Mrs. Gopman and Mr. Palcher for a very successful Art at the Trace on February 6, 2016. He noted the Mayor's Business Breakfast would be March 9, 2016, at Yankee Trace; a Neighborhood Meeting was scheduled March 14, 2016, at Centerville Police Headquarters from 6:30 to 8:00 p.m.

Council members reported on various items of interest. Mr. Beals shared that the Annual Meeting for MVRPC would be April 14, that the Sister City Committee was putting together a trip to Bad Z, Germany, with a river cruise included in 2017, and that Centerville Washington History would have a segment of its speaker series at Rec West on February 16 at 7:00 p.m. Mrs. Rau announced the City Beautiful Commission would sponsor its annual spring seminar with a presentation on perennials at Centerville High School on April 2 at 10:00 a.m. Mr. Kenley said she would be attending an upcoming meeting of the Ohio Municipal League in Columbus to interview candidates as the new director.

Mr. Horn stated appreciation for the outstanding work of the street crews keeping streets clear over the winter months. He encouraged everyone to enjoy the Friday Fish Fry and Sunday Brunch at Yankee Trace and noted that Yankee Trace had its best January revenue in ten years.

Mrs. Gopman presented the code enforcement report as well as the community calendar for the remainder of February and for March.

Mr. Horn asked the municipal attorney to give an update on the decision of the Ohio Supreme Court regarding the Sugarcreek fire district. Mr. Liberman presented background on the case and reported the Ohio Supreme Court invalidated Sugarcreek Township's fire district and levy ballot issues for the March election, because the township did not follow the proper procedures in placing the items on the ballot.

For the report of the Planning Commission, Mayor Compton noted that Item One had already been handled with the motion to table the Preliminary Development Plan for the Villas of Centerville. Mr. Serr recused himself and left the Council Chambers for Item Two, a Public Hearing for an Appeal of the decision of the Planning Commission concerning three variances for a proposed ground sign for Miami Valley South Hospital along its I-675 frontage.

APPEAL OF DECISION OF PLANNING COMMISSION ON THREE VARIANCES FOR MVHS GROUND SIGN

In the staff report, Mr. Rodney explained, after tabling Application P-2015-0051 at the December meeting, the Planning Commission had denied the request for the three variances

requested by Dianna Conboy of LWC, Corp., on behalf of Miami Valley Hospital South at 2400 Miami Valley Drive for a new ground sign along I-675. The vote to approve the variances was 0-7. The applicant had exercised her right to appeal the decision to the City Council.

Mr. Rodney gave background for the Appeal and showed the current signage for the hospital complex. Mr. Rodney described the sign and noted the current request was 40% smaller than the original submittal. Mr. Rodney overlaid an aerial view with the Master Plan to explain the location of the sign with respect to the long-term layout of the campus. He showed graphic images of the sign, the tree removal plan and the landscaping plan for the brick base. He spoke of the possible relocation of the fence, before enumerating the three variances as follows:

1. Variance for a fifth ground sign on the premises - The UDO limits ground signs to one per premises. Mr. Rodney said the hospital currently has two signs on the each of the frontages of Wilmington Pike and Cloyo Road.
2. Variance for additional sign area - The UDO limits the area of ground signs to 32 square feet per face. The application requested 448 square feet per face.
3. Variance for additional sign height - The UDO limits the height to six feet at the right-of-way. The application requested 15 feet. The ground level may need to be raised two feet, if the ODOT fence is not able to be removed.

Staff favored granting the variances, because of the large size of the property, the single user, and the significant length (nearly 3000 feet) of frontage. The hospital could not be readily seen from the highway, because of perimeter trees and undergrowth. The main building was set back about 600 feet from the right-of-way and an additional 50-60 feet from the pavement. Mr. Rodney also pointed out that the zoning code for signage was designed for speeds of 35-45 mph on city streets versus speeds of 65-70 mph on an interstate highway that included multiple lanes of traffic. Staff recommended approval of the three sign variances with the following one condition:

1. Applicant should provide an updated grading plan to the Planning Department for approval, with the change in current ground level not to exceed two (2) feet.

Explaining the Planning Commission's denial of the variances, Mr. Rodney stated the Planning Commission did not believe the variances met numerous standards of approval, especially, the standard for hardship not created by the owner. Some wanted a tree preservation area to be defined so that the lack of visibility of the hospital was a basis for the variance for the long-term, since variances stay with the property in perpetuity. Some members felt a standard ODOT hospital sign would suffice and were concerned about setting a precedent for a proliferation of signage along the interstate corridor.

When Mayor Compton opened the Public Hearing, Mr. Robert Curry, 530 Maysfield Road, Dayton, the attorney representing the interests of the hospital, introduced Ms. Mary Boosalis, Executive Vice President and Chief Operating Officer of Premier Health, who said the company felt the sign was important to the future growth of the Miami Valley Hospital South site. She stressed the campus, entirely constructed since 2007, had been highly successful. She

said the sign was important because the hospital was not visible from the interstate highway and because brand recognition was essential to success in a highly competitive market. She thanked City Staff for its support.

Mr. Curry gave some additional background related to the variances. He pointed out the sign standards were one size fits all while the large hospital campus was not a typical user. The hospital campus included multiple users under one umbrella; variances should be unexpected. He shared photos of existing signage.

Andy English, a landscape architect from Innocom, Inc., 7792 Olentangy River Road, Columbus, explained the choice for the location of the sign was based on requirements set by ODOT and the presence of small pockets of wetlands of less than 0.1 acres. He noted that only trees in the view corridor would be removed and that ODOT was now requiring the sign to be an additional four feet back from the right-of-way.

Peter Williams of Innocom, Inc., 7792 Olentangy River Road, Columbus, stated the Innocom team designed all newer Premier signs. The ground sign in question was atypical, because most Premier signs were wall signs. When compared to the ground sign for Upper Valley Medical Center in Miami County, the proposed Centerville sign was slightly larger. He said the sign needed to be big for driver safety and noted the size of the sign was dictated by the high speed of traffic and the time needed to change lanes to exit. Mr. Curry verified that Mr. Williams felt this sign proposal was the minimum size required. Mr. Williams cited the recommendations of the United States Sign Council.

Mr. Curry discussed the Standards of Approval of Article 5.17(D) of the UDO. He disagreed with the evaluation of the Planning Commission and stated the reasons each standard was met. He respectfully requested approval of the variances.

Dr. Paul Gresham, 870 Vintage Lake Court, Centerville, asked the Council to uphold the decision of the Planning Commission. He said it was unclear what real purpose the sign served—except brand recognition—when a standard ODOT sign would suffice. In general, most people who were sent to a specific hospital by the referring physician knew or could find the hospital prior to travelling. He noted emergency room care was less efficient and more expensive than other avenues of care. The City should not encourage people to use an emergency room when other medical care would be adequate. He pointed out Ms. Boosalis said the hospital was flourishing; this success was without the sign. The owners created the hardship by the placement of the buildings on the campus and by the decision not to designate a tree preservation area, as requested by the Planning Commission. He felt these factors should be considered in evaluating the Appeal.

Mr. Mark Shaker, 3573 Springdale Drive, President and CEO of Miami Valley, said the master plan had been the “best guess” of the company in 2005. As Joann Ringer had stated at Planning Commission, Premier did not want to limit choices for the future by designating a tree preservation area. Mrs. Rau asked if future users would impact the proposed sign. Mr. Shaker said he had no exact answer. Upon question from Mr. Beals, Mr. Shaker said he did not envision other signs along I-675 on the hospital property.

Mayor Compton agreed the size of the campus with 115 acres and nearly 3000 feet of frontage on the northern boundary was a significant factor. He also was impressed by the need for additional size of the lettering for readability to allow time to change lanes and exit.

Mr. Beals questioned the need for the wall used as a base for the sign and its length. Mr. Williams responded that the sign's wall was a landscaped architectural feature that gestured back to the campus, giving directionality to the proposed sign. Mr. English said the sign was modeled after the Upper Valley Medical Center sign and that the landscaping beds would add interest and aesthetics throughout the year with bold movements of changing color.

Mr. Engert started a discussion of the trees on the north side of the property. He asked about the number and types of trees to be cut. Mayor Compton pointed out that nearly all the trees on the north side of the property would have to be cut down, in order for a wall sign on the hospital to be visible from I-675. Mr. Curry again said it was premature to designate a tree preservation area. Mr. Rodney added that staff was supportive of a holistic view and future conversations about areas for green space.

Mr. Beals initiated a discussion of the Planning Commission decision on the variances. He noted that Planning Commission did not see enough basis for the variance. Mrs. Rau added Mr. Durham stated Standards 1, 3, 4, 5, and 7 were not met. Mr. Beals asked if Planning Commission was aware of the acreage and the length of the frontage. Mr. Rodney answered in the affirmative. Mr. Beals stated he would want a sign on the third frontage, if it were his business. Mayor Compton asked if the traffic issue was discussed. Mr. Rodney stated it was mentioned and was in the staff report. Before stating that he felt the application met the Standards for Granting a Variance, Mayor Compton also pointed out that the sign was more than a standard sign; it was an architectural feature. Mrs. Kenley said the sign would fit in nicely with the feel of the campus.

Mr. Palcher asked whether any other conditions should be considered. Mr. Rodney said he was unaware of others and was satisfied with the one condition related to grading. Mayor Compton closed the Public Hearing.

Mrs. Rau commented that hospitals were unique because they often involve people in distress. A significant sign would be reassuring and helpful for directing people under duress.

Mr. Palcher made a motion to grant the Appeal of the January 24, 2016 decision of the Planning Commission for the three variances requested in revised Application P-2015-0051, subject to the one condition recommended by staff as shown above. Mrs. Kenley seconded the motion. The motion passed 6-0. Mr. Serr returned to the Council Chambers at this time.

Mayor Compton explained that the Consent Agenda contains routine procedural and administrative matters the Council had discussed in Work Sessions. Members of Council read the Consent Agenda items into the record.

- A. Resolution Number 1-16, A Resolution Appointing Carin R. Andrews As Clerk Of Council, Beginning February 22, 2016.

- B. Resolution Number 2-16, A Resolution Granting A Non-Exclusive Easement To E & E Properties, Inc. For Private Stormwater Infrastructure Over The City Of Centerville Property Located Along East Franklin Street.
- C. Resolution Number 3-16, A Resolution Accepting The Bid Submitted By Southeastern Equipment Company Of Monroe, Ohio For The Purchase Of One Articulated Wheel Loader And Authorizing The City Manager To Enter Into A Contract In Connection Therewith.
- D. Resolution Number 4-16, A Resolution Accepting The Bid Submitted By Pengwyn Of Columbus, Ohio For The Purchase Of One 35,000 GVW Dump Truck And Authorizing The City Manager To Enter Into A Contract Therewith.
- E. Resolution Number 5-16, A Resolution Accepting The Bids Submitted By Ohio Irrigation Lawn Sprinkler Systems, Inc. Of Dayton, Ohio, A To Z Lawn And Landscaping, Inc. Of Dayton, Ohio, And Scott's Lawn Services Of West Chester, Ohio For The Maintenance Of Certain Specified City Properties During 2016 And 2017 Throughout The Community And To Authorize The City Manager To Enter Into Contracts In Connection Therewith.
- F. Resolution Number 6-16, A Resolution Authorizing The City Manager To Enter Into An Agreement Between The City Of Centerville And TEC Engineering, Inc., For The MOT-Wilmington Pike Signal System Upgrade Project.
- G. Resolution Number 7-16, A Resolution Accepting The Bid Submitted By Ohio Irrigation Lawn Sprinkler Systems, Inc. For The Landscaping Management Of Benham's Grove And Authorizing The City Manager To Enter Into An Agreement In Connection Therewith.
- H. Resolution Number 8-16, A Resolution Accepting The Bids Submitted By Advanced Turf Solutions, Green Velvet Sod Farms, Harrell's LLC, Helena Chemical, Site One Landscape Supply, And Trupointe Turf & Ornamentals For Chemicals For The Golf Club At Yankee Trace And Authorizing The City Manager To Enter Into Contracts In Connection Therewith.
- I. A Resolution Number 9-16, A Resolution Accepting The Bids Submitted By Advanced Turf Solutions, Green Velvet Sod Farms, Harrell's LLC, Helena Chemical, Site One Landscape Supply, And Trupointe Turf & Ornamentals For Fertilizer For The Golf Club At Yankee Trace And Authorizing The City Manager To Enter Into Contracts In Connection Therewith.
- J. Reappointments.
 - 1. Bryce Nickel As A Member Of The Personnel Appeals Board For An Additional Three-Year Term And As A Member of The Centerville City School District Personnel Appeals Board For An Additional Three-Year Term.

2. Norman Plair As A Member Of The Personnel Appeals Board For An Additional Three-Year Term.

Mr. Beals sponsored the Consent Agenda and moved for its approval. Mr. Palcher seconded the motion for the Consent Agenda. The motion passed with 7 ayes.

PUBLIC HEARING: ORDINANCE NUMBER 02-16
NATIONAL RESIDENTIAL ELECTRICAL CODE

The Public Hearing was held concerning Ordinance Number 02-16. Mr. Cahall explained references in the Municipal Code periodically needed to be revised to reflect the latest standards to be used by the Building Inspection Department. The most recent update was for the Residential Electrical Code. An Emergency Ordinance was passed in January so the new regulations could become effective in a timely manner.

Mrs. Kenley sponsored Ordinance Number 02-16, An Ordinance Amending Section 1424.01, Regarding Adoption Of Standardized Building And Housing Codes, and moved for its approval. Mr. Serr seconded the motion. The motion passed 7-0.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned. The next meeting of the Centerville City Council was scheduled for March 21, 2016.

Approved: *Brock A. Compton*
Mayor

ATTEST: *Julia M. Weaver*
Asst. Clerk of Council