

CENTERVILLE PLANNING COMMISSION
Regular Meeting
Tuesday, July 29, 2014

Mr. Clark called the meeting to order at 7:30 p.m.

ATTENDANCE

Present: Mr. Paul Clark, Ms. Amy Korenyi-Both, Mr. Jim Briggs, Mr. Bill Eton, Mr. Robert Muzechuk, Mr. Jim Durham and Mr. Kevin Von Handorf. Also present: City Planner Andrew Rodney, Planner/GIS Analyst Mark Yandrick, Municipal Attorney Scott Liberman, Mr. John Palcher, and Assistant Clerk of Council Julie Weaver.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MOTION: Mr. Durham made a motion to approve the minutes of the Planning Commission Meeting of June 24, 2014. Ms Korenyi Both seconded the motion. The motion passed 6-0-1, with Mr. Briggs abstaining.

Before he proceeded with the evening's agenda, Mr. Clark read a statement with information about Planning Commission procedures and appropriate behavior by the gallery during public hearings.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

Application P-2014-0019: Conditional Use for the Expansion of South Dayton Presbyterian Church, 1180 E. Alex Bell Road - Applicant, Norm Beebe, Trustee.

Mr. Rodney presented the staff report for a conditional use application for the expansion of a legally non-conforming use (a church with over 150 seats in an area zoned R-1b) for South Dayton Presbyterian Church to expand the existing building and associated parking. He pointed out that the existing use along the south side of Alex-Bell Road was fairly remote from the adjacent single family homes. The church had existed as a good neighbor since the early 1990's. Mr. Rodney reviewed the standards of approval, before stating that the application met the criteria and recommending approval of the conditional use application, subject to the following two conditions:

1. The Owner shall engage neighboring property owners when necessary to ensure the use can be operated and maintained with minimal impact on adjacent neighborhoods.
2. Absent future development of the site, the existing gravel parking area shall be graded and seeded within twelve (12) months of approval of the conditional use.

Mr. Clark opened the public hearing.

Mr. Kip Turner, a deacon at South Dayton Presbyterian Church, summarized the history, the scope of the project and the need for the addition of the Sunday School and associated amenities that would allow the congregation to grow. He noted that Bruns Contracting was the project manager.

MOTION: Mr. Durham moved to recommend to Council the approval of Conditional Use Application P-2014-0019, subject to the conditions requested by staff. Mr. Briggs seconded the motion. The motion passed 7-0.

Application P-2014-0022: Variance Application by South Dayton Presbyterian Church, 1180 E. Alex Bell Road – Norm Beebe, Applicant.

Mr. Rodney announced that the items covered in this variance application had been resolved, and the public hearing was no longer needed. The application was withdrawn.

Application P-2014-0023: Variance Application for Creative World Montessori, 6775-6833 Wilmington Pike – Karen Lampe, Applicant.

Mr. Rodney gave the staff report concerning a request by Karen Lampe of Creative World Montessori and James Connell of JD Connell, General Contractors, for a variance related to screening and buffering at 6775-6833 Wilmington Pike. Mr. Rodney noted that the applicants had initially requested four variances, but had made changes, so only one issue remained. The single request was for relief from the requirements of the Unified Development Ordinance regarding mounding, buffering and screening on the north, west and south property boundaries in the R-1c zoning district. The contractor asked that the existing growth along the perimeter of the property be allowed to serve as the required buffering. Mr. Rodney showed photos of the property and the natural mixture of landscaping present to screen the 15,500 sq. ft. building from the residential neighbors in Cheltenham and Walnut Creek. In Mr. Rodney's opinion, the presence of the significant number of trees and shrubs met the purpose and intent of the UDO screening regulations. The UDO requires 3 ft. of mounding, 5 canopy trees, 6 understory trees, 20 shrubs, and 15 evergreens or conifers per 100 linear feet of the property line within a 25 ft. buffer. He recommended approval of the variance, subject to the following conditions:

1. Any existing foliage which no longer serves the general purpose of screening and buffering shall be replaced in a reasonable time period to provide the required screening.

Mr. Durham stated that meeting the purpose and intent of the UDO required yeararound screening. He agreed that clear cutting seemed overly aggressive, but also felt that evergreens were needed. Discussion followed. Mr. Durham suggested the contractor could be required to add a smaller number of larger evergreens at a cost equivalent to the price of clearing the area, creating mounding and planting the normal screening.

Mr. Clark opened the public hearing.

Ms. Karen Lampe, Creative World Montessori, 8003 Country Brook, Springboro, stated that, as President of Creative World Montessori, she felt the new building itself would be a good buffer between the residences and the businesses along Wilmington Pike. She said the current tree line was a better buffer than what was required by the UDO. She noted that the school needed two playground areas in order to separate age groups, and it was unsafe to have evergreens inside the fence, hiding young children from caretakers.

Mr. Durham stated that evergreens could be placed strategically where they would have the greatest impact and would not need to be evenly spaced or within the fence. Ms. Lampe pointed out the ample width of the current buffers and the need for adequate sunlight for evergreens.

Mr. Clark noted the receipt of an email from Kesval Govender of 2595 Hingham Lane, who voiced concerns about privacy in winter when leaves were off the trees and shrubs in the buffer.

Phil Kern 2560 Briggs Road, spoke against the plan to develop the property. He noted the winter screening issue, the dangerous driveway access at White's Corner at Hingham Lane, mailboxes being damaged by cars using the Cheltenham entry island as place for U-turns so northbound traffic could access the right turn on Wilmington Pike and worries about the drainage ditch fed by the ponds in Cheltenham.

Steve Dean, 2544 Briggs Road, stated concern that the public hearing notice listed the address of the school as 6775 Wilmington Pike, ignoring the other properties involved. He said many of the trees growing on the property were ash, so the current density would be reduced by the death of diseased trees and the loss of surrounding growth as dead trees were taken out. He said he had no problem with the use of the property as a school, but wanted the greatest screening density possible. He agreed with the need for better fall and winter screening.

Corinne Smith, 2300 Baldwin and President of the Cheltenham Homeowners' Association, voiced concern for the integrity of the subdivision as a quiet neighborhood with little traffic, for damaged mailboxes, for overplanting that kills off screening and for removal of diseased trees leaving blank areas. She asked for a significant number of evergreens in the screening.

Danny Sprouse, 2525 Indian Summer Drive and President of the Walnut Creek Homeowners' Association, echoed the concerns about the screening and ash trees. He stated that much of the current vegetation was invasive honeysuckle which was a battle to control. He also said that the traffic problems at White's Corner Road would be complicated by the presence of additional cars and suggested that some hours of the day would need "no right turns on red" from Wilmington Pike to prevent accidents as cars exit the new driveway. He said proper maintenance of the perimeter was a key for the neighbors.

Cheryl Kern, 2560 Briggs Road, voiced concern about winter screening. She said noise from the school playground would be present yeararound. When she asked who would monitor the need to replace diseased or dead trees, Mr. Rodney stated it was a partnership. The City Zoning Inspectors check properties and neighbors can call to report problems. Mr. Etson asked if any homeowners had added screening on their side of the lot lines, to which Ms. Kern answered in the affirmative.

Jim Connell, JD Connell Contractor, 3650 Somerset Drive, Beaver creek, construction manager for the project, asked for a definition of screening that enumerated the required opacity. Mr. Connell asked the Planning Commissioners to keep in mind that a 25' buffer was required; the parcel had close to 50' in many areas. He felt the natural growth was better for the neighbors than mounding and new plantings. In his way of thinking, interspersing old and new would be difficult. Some screening would be destroyed to access areas for new plantings. The natural vegetation would overtake new plantings, causing losses. It would be cheaper and easier to do the mounding and minimum required landscaping. As the contractor, he felt there were only two practical choices—a variance for the status quo or meeting the required standard with mounding and new plantings.

Ms. Korenyi-Both and Mr. Durham took exception to the idea that there was no middle ground. Mr. Durham expressed the need to inventory what is currently onsite, so that the board would not make a decision based on inadequate information. Ms. Korenyi-Both agreed, saying she did not want a hodge-podge of plantings that would not be best for the year-round protection of the neighbors in the longterm.

When Mr. Clark looked to the applicant for comment, Mr. Scott Wright, 7813 Country Brook Lane, Springboro, stated that he wanted to voice support for the variance. He said that the beautiful new building itself would be an improvement over outdated homes that had maintenance and use violations. Mr. Etson, Ms. Korenyi Both and Mr. Wright discussed the dilemma of old versus new plantings.

Mr. Clark closed the public hearing.

MOTION: Mr. Durham moved to table the application. The motion died for lack of a second.

MOTION: Following discussion with Mr. Durham about obtaining more information, Ms. Korenyi-Both made a motion to table the application to the next meeting, requesting a report by an arborist evaluating the current plantings and reporting if it would be possible to enhance what is there with evergreens and to remove diseased trees without diminishing the overall screening that is present. Mr. Von Handorf seconded the motion. In a roll call vote, the Planning Commisison voted 4-3 to table the matter to the next meeting, with Mr. Briggs, Mr. Etson and Mr. Muzechuk voting nay.

OLD BUSINESS

Application P-2014-0013, Amendment 1 to the Approved Final Development Plan for the Randall Residence at Yankee Trace – Applicant, John Roll of Roll & Associates

MOTION: Mr. Durham made a motion to remove the Application P-2014-0013 from the table for consideration. Mr. Briggs seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously, 7-0.

Mr. Rodney reviewed the amendment to the approved Final Development Plan requesting changes to the stormwater plan required by the EPA and the Army Corps of Engineers and eliminating the roundabout on Sawgrass Boulevard. The roundabout had been the issue causing the application to be tabled in May. In the interim, it was discovered that an error in scale as the roundabout was overlaid on the site plan had oversized the impact of the roundabout on the surrounding development. The problem had been corrected, and the size of the roundabout was no longer an issue for the developer. Mr. Rodney reviewed the map for the roundabout, before noting that the stormwater plan had been explained at the May meeting and had not changed since that time. He went over the standards of approval and recommended acceptance of the amendments to the stormwater plan for the Final Development Plan, subject to the following two conditions:

1. All other previous Conditions of Approval from the approved Preliminary Development Plan (P-2013-0051) and Final Development Plan (P-2014-0002) shall remain in effect.
2. A revised Stormwater Drainage Report reflecting the proposed changes shall be submitted and approved by the City Engineer in accordance with Article 9.35 of the UDO.

Following questions about accommodating fire equipment, calming traffic, preventing cut-throughs, and sizing the footprint of the roundabout, Mr. Clark opened the public hearing.

The applicant, architect John Roll of Roll & Associates, noted that he and engineer David Winemiller were present to answer questions.

Mrs. Martha Gardner of 10000 Sand Wedge Court in Yankee Trace spoke of ongoing concerns for water in the back yards of the six homes in her neighborhood.

Mr. Paul Garland, 10012 Sand Wedge Court, had photos of water in his yard on June 23, 2014. Mr. Sliemers gave Mr. Garland his business card for follow-up.

Mr. Max Treon, 10024 Sand Wedge Court, asked if his property flooded before the construction of his home. He described water 2 ½ ft deep in Paul Garland's yard and six inches deep flowing across his neighbor's costly patio following a storm on June 23, 2014. He asked for help in solving the current problems. Assistant City Engineer John Sliemers explained the responsibilities of the various parties involved.

Lynn Rogers, 10239 Paragon Road pointed out that Mr. Minch had said he would help the water problems in Yankee Trace.

Mr. Treon stated that he did not think that intercepting water coming from the bus barn would reduce his water problems.

Seeing no more speakers, Mr. Clark closed the public hearing.

MOTION: Mr. Durham made a motion to recommend approval to City Council of Amendment 1 to the Approved Final Development Plan for the changes to the stormwater drainage plan for the Randall Residence, subject to the two staff conditions shown above. Mr. Etson seconded the motion. The motion passed 7-0.

NEW BUSINESS

Application P-2014-0017: Superior Dental Care Replat, 6683 Centerville Business Parkway – Applicant, Heather Wiehe

Mr. Rodney presented the staff report concerning the request by Superior Dental Care to consolidate its two lots at the northwest corner of Centerville Business Parkway and Cloy Road, so that a single monument sign can be erected advertising tenants for both properties. He used a zoning map and the record plan to explain the consolidation. He recommended approval of the application.

MOTION: Mr. Briggs made a motion to recommend to Council the approval of the revision of the current plat. Mr. Muzechuk seconded the motion. The motion passed 7-0.

Application P-2014-0018: Major Site Plan for Creative World Montessori School, 6775-6883 Wilmington Pike – Applicant, Karen Lampe by James Connell

Mr. Rodney presented the staff report for the school/daycare center on 4.5 acres in an R-1c zoning district at 6775 Wilmington Pike near White's Corner. The 15,500 sq. ft. building would house up to 236 children in grades Pre K through 8. He showed pictures of the site, the screening, topography, the existing structures, neighboring uses and the terminus of Indian Summer Drive. He discussed the access points, the demolition plan, replacement of the gravel drive, removal of some trees and rehabilitation of a storage shed. No left-hand turn from the northbound lanes of Wilmington Pike will be permitted. He projected the site plan, the landscape plan, and colorized elevation drawings, noting that the 4 in 12 slope of the roof made the building more in keeping with the nearby residences.

After reviewing the Standards of Approval, Mr. Rodney stated the plan met the standards with the exception of the issue covered in the variance. He recommended approval of the Major Site Plan, subject to the six conditions shown below.

1. Any existing foliage along the north, west, and south property lines which no longer serves the general purpose of screening and buffering shall be replaced in a reasonable time period to provide the required screening.
2. Landscaping shall be provided along the western edge of the primary drive to Whites Corner to serve as additional buffering and screening at the direction of the City Planner.
3. Existing curb cuts on Wilmington Pike shall be removed and restored at the direction of the City Engineer.
4. The height, material, and location of the proposed 4-foot black vinyl chainlink perimeter fence shall be approved with this Major Site Plan. A separate fence permit shall not be required. A change in height, material, or location shall not require a Major Site Plan amendment, but shall require a fence permit.
5. No signage is approved as part of this Major Site Plan.
6. If it is to remain, the existing shed along the southern property line is to be refurbished to architecturally mimic the proposed building.

Questions followed concerning the prohibition of chain link fence along Wilmington Pike, the sidewalk along Wilmington Pike, the distance from the property line to the detention pond, traffic lanes and safety at White's Corner, and fence within the western bufferyard.

Mr. Clark opened the public hearing.

Ms. Karen Lampe, the applicant from Creative World Montessori, stated the company was planning a decorative fence along the Wilmington Pike frontage, not chainlink. She also clarified that the detention pond would be within the 50' buffer, but not the required 25' buffer. She commented on the extended timeline for the drop off and pick up of students. She also stated that a wooded area near the rear lot line in a reserve area would be used for educational experiences.

Mr. Durham asked that the fence be moved to at least 50' from the terminus of Indian Summer Drive, so it would be away from the public right-of-way and not seen from the street.

Mr. Clark brought up the plainness of the two story section of the gymnasium in the rear of the building. Mr. Durham agreed that the three walls of the gym should have a horizontal relief (possibly a cap lining up with the nearby fascia) in a different material, color, or texture. Under the horizontal band, faux windows or a Dryvit change could add interest. There was discussion of the rooflines on the front of the building. Marika Snider of Snider Architects in Beaver Creek was amenable to adding visual interest to the exterior gym walls.

Mr. Clark closed the public hearing.

MOTION: Mr. Durham made a motion to approve Application P-214-0018, the Major Site Plan for 6775-6883 Wilmington Pike, subject to the six conditions recommended by staff with the following changes and additions:

Mr. Durham said to fix Condition 1 to read ‘foliage or new plantings’ and omit the directions.

7. There shall be no pedestrian or vehicular access via Indian Summer Drive.
8. Chain link fence shall not be used along the Wilmington Pike frontage.
9. The rear yard fence is to be moved further from Indian Summer Drive in a configuration to be determined by staff.
10. Architectural relief is to be added to all three exterior walls of the gym in accordance with comments made during the meeting concerning banding of color, texture or a change in material, subject to approval by the City Planner.

Mr. Briggs seconded the motion. A roll call vote showed that the motion passed 7-0.

Application P-2014-0020: Record Plan Changing Lot Lines for South Dayton Presbyterian Church, 1180 E. Alex-Bell Road – Applicant, Norm Beebe, Trustee.

Mr. Rodney gave the staff report for this application That requested the redrawing of the lot line for the adjoining parcels on the 6.69 acres of church property on the south side of E. Alex-Bell Road east of Clyo Road. With redrawing the line, about 2.51 acres would remain as a vacant remnant lot. Without relocating the lot line farther west, the City would have had to require additional screening, landscaping and cross easements between the two lots. Mr. Rodney pointed out the proposed access easement on the north along E. Alex-Bell Road that would give the western lot access to ingress and egress along the eastern parcel frontage in perpetuity. Mr. Rodney noted that about a third of the church property to the south and east would be a drainage basin and easement in perpetuity and therefore would not be able to be developed. He recommended approval of the application, subject to the following condition:

1. The fee-simple lot owned by the City of Centerville consisting of Alex-Bell Road right-of-way shall be dedicated as part of this replat.

Mr. Durham described a problem arising out of moving the interior property line rather than consolidating the two lots. If the church sold the remnant parcel, the new owner would have a right to use the dedicated access in front of the church to enter and exit onto E. Alex-Bell Road. Mr. Durham stated that consolidating the lots accomplished the current purpose, and the lot could be subdivided later, if the Trustees so desired.

Mr. Kip Turner, deacon for South Dayton Presbyterian Church said that the church would be fine with either one or two lots on the plat. Mr. Bill Davis with Bruns Construction agreed that the purchaser of the remnant lot would have access rights. Mr. Durham and Mr. Briggs felt that having one lot would retain future options.

MOTION: Mr. Durham made a motion to recommend to Council the record plan for South Dayton Presbyterian Church at 1180 E. Alex-Bell Road, subject to the condition that the record plan be platted as a single parcel and with the condition recommended by staff as shown above. Mr. Etson seconded the motion. The motion passed 7-0.

Application P-2014-0021: Major Site Plan for S. Dayton Presbyterian Church, 1180 E. Alex-Bell Road – Applicant, Norm Beebe, Trustee.

Planner/GIS Analyst Mark Yandrick gave the staff report for the application for about 4400 sq. ft. of classroom space, 186 sq. ft. of kitchen, 593 sq. ft. of entry and an additional 32 parking spaces. He used a zoning map, an aerial, a colorized elevation gradient map and photos to explain the request. This parcel, zoned R-1b, falls off to the south where drainage swales and detention areas are located. The non-conforming gravel entrance must be upgraded to asphalt and additional landscaping will be required.

Mr. Yandrick described the new building elevations; the original church has brick facades and horizontal siding. He pointed out the window lintels and sills of the addition do not match the windows in the older section of the building. Horizontal siding was used in the new inset, because the applicant felt it would be difficult to get matching brick. Sidewalk will connect to sidewalk along E. Alex-Bell Road. The site plan included ample parking; the access from the second lot would be right in and right out. Mr. Yandrick went over the Standards of Approval and made a recommendation for approval of the Major Site Plan, subject to the following two conditions:

1. Approval of the Major Site Plan is contingent on approval of a Conditional Use Certificate by the City Council.
2. Detailed plan review comments from the Engineering Office shall be incorporated into the construction plans subject to approval by the City Engineer.

Mr. Kip Turner, deacon for the church, spoke about the use of the horizontal siding on the inset area to the right of the new entry; the architect felt it would be difficult to match the old brick and the mortar. The inset would have two windows, rather than the three used in other sections of the frontage. Mr. Durham questioned the use of two rather than three windows and the use of horizontal siding on the front of the building. Mr. Turner noted that the interior of the inset was one big room with a room divider in the middle making the center window impossible. Mr. Etson clarified the length of the inset at about 40 feet. Members brainstormed to find an acceptable solution, with little consensus. Some members wanted brick and matching windows, while others felt the submission was fine, especially since landscaping would hide the lower portion of the inset.

Bringing up another issue, Mr. Turner noted the condition that the church could not pave over the existing gravel drive, without tests by a soil's engineer to determine if the old drive had a suitable substrate. The area must be tested and the results conveyed to the City Engineer before paving can take place. He stated that the church would do what was required and would hire a geotechnical engineer to test and make recommendations.

Mr. Clark closed the public comment portion of the review.

MOTION: Mr. Durham made a motion to require brick on the façade of the inset on the right front of the building. Mr. Briggs seconded the motion. In a roll call vote, the motion passed 4-3 with Mr. Etson, Mr. Muzechuk, and Ms. Korenyi-Both voting nay.

MOTION: Mr. Durham then made a motion for approval of the Major Site Plan for the expansion of South Dayton Presbyterian Church as requested in Application P-2014-0021, subject to the use of brick on the front insert and the two conditions recommended by staff as shown above. Mr. Briggs seconded the motion. The motion passed 7-0.

COMMUNICATIONS

Mr. Rodney briefly updated the Planning Commission on the following:

- He shared an article on how Planning Commission can go about making legal site visits.
- He noted that Cornerstone and Costco construction had begun. Final grading plans were being reviewed. A development plan for Phase 1B may be coming in a few months.
- The cul-de-sac on Compark Road at the Dan Wilson property was nearly complete.
- Construction plans for the Centerville Place parking lot were submitted for review.
- The record plan for The Grove at Yankee Trace was approved at Council.
- Nothing had been submitted by the CESO or Ryan Homes since the approval of the Preliminary Development Plan for the Zengel Development. A staff report on traffic calming for Zengel Drive is due to Council in August.

The next meeting of the Centerville Planning Commission will be August 26, 2014 at 7:30 p.m. in the Council Chambers. There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.



Mr. Paul Clark, Planning Commission Chair