

CENTERVILLE PLANNING COMMISSION

Regular Meeting

Tuesday, January 30, 2007

Mr. Clark called the meeting to order at 7:30 P.M.

Attendance: Mr. Paul Clark, Chairman; Mr. Jim Briggs; Mr. Jim Brunner; Mr. Jeff Gammell; Mrs. Carolyn Meininger; Mr. Mark Leonard; Mr. Jim Durham.. Also present: Mr. Steve Feverston, City Planner; Mr. Scott Liberman, City Attorney; Mr. Doug Spittler, City Engineer.

Approval of Minutes:

MOTION: Mr. Briggs moved to approve the Planning Commission minutes of the November 28, 2006, as written. Mr. Brunner seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 7-0.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

GraceWorks Lutheran Services (Bethany Lutheran Village) - Major Use Special Approval

Mr. Feverston reviewed the Major Use Special Approval application submitted by Graceworks Lutheran Services for Bethany Lutheran Village located at 6451 Far Hills Avenue. The existing retirement project is located on a 98 acre tract of land zoned Residential Planned Development, R-PD, which permits a Retirement Community. The request is to modify the approved Master Plan for the entire site; approval of Phase 1 of the Bethany Lutheran Village campus to include a memory support center, village center, independent living apartment and cottages, re-clad the existing tower and a two-story parking garage; and approval of a variance to permit a maximum building height of 55 feet for the independent living apartments.

Mr. Feverston noted a variance was granted for building height by the Planning Commission in January, 1989, to permit a maximum building height of 49.5 feet for the existing independent living apartment building.

The majority of the expansion to the campus will be located in the central portion of the existing community. Study Area A, contained in the Create the Vision Community Plan, will be left vacant satisfying the open space goal. Four (4) additional cottages are proposed to be located on one "eyebrow" road and another 6 cottages on a separate "eyebrow" road will be incorporated into the area of the existing cottages on the site. A new lakefront road will be constructed with additional cottages along that lake frontage. An expansion to the existing independent-living apartments will be constructed which will connect to a new retail/gathering space facility. The purpose of the gathering space is to focus the activity to a public square concept for the entire campus. The boulevard street from SR 48 will be relocated bending to the southwest extending to the focal area of the village square with a large public green space. The existing tower on the site will be refaced and a new memory care unit building will be constructed on the site. A 2-level parking garage will be constructed as a part of this improvement to the campus in addition to the other improvements.

The architecture proposed for the village square center matches much of what is used within the Bethany campus most closely matching the independent-living apartments. It will be constructed principally of brick material and have a pitched roof. The expansion to the

independent-living apartments will be 3 stories in height and is the subject of the height variance being requested for this project. The memory care unit will have the reverse of building materials being constructed principally of a external insulation finishing system (E.I.F.S.) with a brick base and some brick accents on other portions of the building. As part of Phase 2, some of the existing cottages will be redeveloped. The existing tower will be refaced with brick and E.I.F.S. to compliment the other buildings in the campus. A public green space area will be created with the removal of the existing parking areas and parking will be provided with the construction of the parking garage. A water feature will be located next the parking garage and apartment building to create an attractive entryway into the village square area.

Staff recommended approval of the Major Use Special Approval application subject to the following conditions:

1. The Planning Commission shall approve a variance to permit the independent living apartment building a maximum height of fifty-five (55) feet.
2. The applicant shall submit a construction schedule that details when the infrastructure including the street, detention basin, sidewalks, grading and building are to be built.
3. All private streets shall be constructed to City standards excepting street width as shown on the Major Use Plan subject to approval by the City Engineering Department.
4. All streets and drives shall intersect at ninety (90) degree angles to the greatest extent practical subject to approval by the City Engineering Department.
5. All street names shall be subject to approval by the City Planning Department.
6. The new drive and adjacent parking lot east of the proposed front tower shall be modified to provide access for emergency purposes subject to approval by the City Engineering Department.
7. A minimum vehicle height clearance of fourteen (14) feet shall be provided for the Village Center building over Bethany Village Drive.
8. Pedestrian crosswalks shall cross streets and drives perpendicularly at intersections and be delineated on the pavement.
9. Any pedestrian walk(s) required by law shall be subject to approval by the City Planning Department to provide connectivity to existing or proposed pedestrian walks.
10. The proposed sidewalk along the new lake road shall be a continuous path uninterrupted by parking stalls subject to approval by the Planning Department.
11. The developer shall pay a fee-in-lieu of dedicating parkland in accordance with the provisions of the City Parkland Dedication Ordinance.

12. A final grading, stormwater drainage and erosion control plan shall be subject to approval by the City Engineering Department showing drainage calculations and incorporating detention and erosion control during construction in accordance with the City Stormwater Drainage Control Ordinance. Additionally, any proposed impervious areas shall be figured into overall detention calculations.
13. An easement shall be recorded to allow for emergency access to all retention/detention basins by the City.
14. Fire hydrants shall be located within four hundred (400) feet of all designated building access points as measured along actual fire apparatus routes of travel.
15. A hard surface roadway capable of providing emergency vehicle access and support at all times for emergency purposes shall be provided during construction.
16. The Planning Commission shall approve the architectural design of the proposed buildings to assure the materials, building form, massing and architectural features create a unified design on the premises and shall be visually compatible with the surrounding buildings. Specifically, the Planning Commission must approve the stucco as an exterior siding material for the memory support building.
17. The final architectural design of the parking garage shall be subject to approval by the Planning Commission.
18. A final exterior lighting plan shall be subject to approval by the City Planning Department.
19. All dumpsters shall be screened using brick and/or stone to match the exterior materials of the proposed village center, memory support, and apartment buildings subject to approval by the City Planning Department.
20. A fire hydrant shall be located within seventy-five (75) feet of any fire department connection.
21. A traffic study for the intersection of SR 48 and Bethany Village Drive shall be conducted prior to first construction to insure sufficient capacity, particularly the northbound left-turn lane.

Mr. Durham stated he felt a separate application should be submitted concerning the variance being sought for building height rather than it being incorporated into the Major Use Special Approval application. Further, he stated he felt there was a lack of architectural information for the members to be certain the architectural elements to be used on each building and the building placement on the site would fit and compliment each other. He suggested a work session be scheduled to consider the proposed architecture.

Mr. Clark opened the public hearing.

Mr. Michael Wildermuth, architect for the project and representing GraceWorks Lutheran Services, stated the independent-living buildings were structured to be the largest component of the project. He stated the architecture of each component was determined to stay with the flavor of the newest buildings on the site in terms of color, building materials and design, and, the stucco and finish on the block on the tower building will bring it into consistency with the other building on the campus. The village center was designed with villa-like architecture to create of more residential appearance. The 2-story parking garage will have 1.5 levels of the building underground and will be constructed with a stucco or finished concrete finish.

Mr. Brunner asked why the building addition would not be constructed at the same height as that existing building to which it would be connected so a variance would not be needed.

Mr. Wildermuth stated the same roof pitch is proposed for the building addition as the existing building, however, the height is driven by the width of the building based on the needed trusses for its construction.

Mr. Jim Morgan, 211 Brookway Road, stated the high point of the Bethany campus is in the southeast corner of the property. The water runoff from Bethany typically runs off to the north and west of the site which greatly affects his property located on the adjacent northeast corner of the project. He stated over the years, water runoff has eroded his property to the point that he had to have a 60 foot long retaining wall constructed to aid in erosion control. Mr. Morgan stated his concern was with additional construction proposed on the campus, the runoff from the site to the creek area and his property will only increase and make an existing condition worse.

Mr. Jeff VanAtta, project engineer for the Bethany, stated their plan for the site development will be in total compliance with the City's stormwater runoff control policy. A stormwater retention basin will be added to the northeast corner of the project site that will control all the new volume runoff.

Mr. Briggs asked if there was any way the existing runoff conditions could be improved along with the proposed improvements to the campus.

Mr. VanAtta stated he had not walked the site and did not know at this time.

Mr. Bryan Coffey, 42 Shadybrook Drive, asked how the issue of preservation and stability of mature neighborhoods was addressed. He stated when he purchased his property much of its appeal was the trees and green space at the rear of the yard. He also asked how much the present population of the campus would increase after the project is complete.

Mr. Feverston stated in this particular case, the expansion to the campus was compressed to allow the preservation of open space abutting the neighboring properties. The population of the campus is not exactly known, however, the number of existing units is 370 and it will increase to 430 units when the expansion is complete. The expansion will increase the number of dwelling units per acre to 4.4 and the R-PD zoning classification allows up to 6.0 dwelling units per acre.

There being no other speakers, Mr. Clark closed the public hearing.

Mr. Durham stated he was remained concerned with the architectural elements proposed for the project as well as the finish proposed on the parking garage.

Mr. Briggs suggested taking action on the application with the exception of the architecture which can be reviewed separately by the Planning Commission.

The members felt the site plan was very well executed with the traffic pattern much improved.

MOTION: Mr. Durham moved to recommend approval of the Major Use Special Approval application submitted by GraceWorks for Bethany Lutheran Village, 6451 Far Hills Avenue, to Council subject to the following conditions:

1. The Planning Commission must approve a variance to permit the independent living apartment building a maximum height of fifty-five (55) feet.
2. The applicant shall submit a construction schedule that details when the infrastructure including the street, detention basin, sidewalks, grading and building are to be built.
3. All private streets shall be constructed to City standards excepting street width as shown on the Major Use Plan subject to approval by the City Engineering Department.
4. All streets and drives shall intersect at ninety (90) degree angles to the greatest extent practical subject to approval by the City Engineering Department.
5. All street names shall be subject to approval by the City Planning Department.
6. The new drive and adjacent parking lot east of the proposed front tower shall be modified to provide access for emergency purposes subject to approval by the City Engineering Department.
7. A minimum vehicle height clearance of fourteen (14) feet shall be provided for the Village Center building over Bethany Village Drive.
8. Pedestrian crosswalks shall cross streets and drives perpendicularly at intersections and be delineated on the pavement.
9. Any pedestrian walk(s) required by law shall be subject to approval by the City Planning Department to provide connectivity to existing or proposed pedestrian walks.
10. The proposed sidewalk along the new lake road shall be a continuous path uninterrupted by parking stalls subject to approval by the Planning Department.
11. The developer shall pay a fee-in-lieu of dedicating parkland in accordance with the provisions of the City Parkland Dedication Ordinance.

12. A final grading, stormwater drainage and erosion control plan shall be subject to approval by the City Engineering Department showing drainage calculations and incorporating detention and erosion control during construction in accordance with the City Stormwater Drainage Control Ordinance. Additionally, any proposed impervious areas shall be figured into overall detention calculations.
13. An easement shall be recorded to allow for emergency access to all retention/detention basins by the City.
14. Fire hydrants shall be located within four hundred (400) feet of all designated building access points as measured along actual fire apparatus routes of travel.
15. A hard surface roadway capable of providing emergency vehicle access and support at all times for emergency purposes shall be provided during construction.
16. Architectural design of the proposed buildings is subject to future approval by the Planning Commission.
17. The final architectural design of the parking garage shall be subject to approval by the Planning Commission.
18. A final exterior lighting plan shall be subject to approval by the City Planning Department.
19. All dumpsters shall be screened using brick and/or stone to match the exterior materials of the proposed village center, memory support, and apartment buildings subject to approval by the City Planning Department.
20. A fire hydrant shall be located within seventy-five (75) feet of any fire department connection.
21. A traffic study for the intersection of SR 48 and Bethany Village Drive shall be conducted prior to first construction to insure sufficient capacity, particularly the northbound left-turn lane.

Mr. Gammell seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 7-0.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

County Down Village - Planning Commission Special Approval

Mr. Feverston requested County down Village remain on the table pending revisions to the plan concerning access. These revisions are a result of conditions placed on the project by the City of Bellbrook for access to Wilmington Pike.

Mr. Clark stated this project has been on the agenda entirely too long and before it comes to the Planning Commission again, all the issues discussed at the time of the original review must be addressed.

Create the Vision Comprehensive Plan - Append Volume 2 to Create Study Areas J and K

Mr. Clark and Mr. Durham suggested Study Areas J and K be discussed by the members in a Work Session prior to any action being recommended to Council.

Dayton Korean Baptist Church

Mr. Feverston reviewed correspondence received from the Dayton Korean Baptist Church, 5051 Wilmington Pike, requesting approval of completion dates for the following items:

1. Review and approval of front and rear exterior parking lighting fixtures - completion upon approval of fixtures and lighting plan.
2. Rear property perimeter privacy fence - completion April, 2007.
3. Remove requirement for rear parking area perimeter curbing - contractor will complete the rear north end parking area as per original approved plans; adjust stormwater collection and detention as required.
4. Install front parking area, and additional area curbing as required - completion August, 2008.
5. Landscaping (trees and shrubs) - completion October, 2007.
6. Rear parking area final overlay asphalt layer - completion August, 2008.

Mr. Feverston stated items 1 and 2 have been completed and approved by staff as part of the building permit plan/permit process.

Mr. Feverston stated concerning item 3# requesting removal of the rear parking area perimeter curbing, perimeter curbing is not required by the City and he recommended the perimeter curbing on the plan be removed.

Staff recommends approval of Items #4 - #6 as requested by the applicant.

Mr. Clark asked if there were any concerns regarding the degradation of the parking areas if left incomplete until August, 2008.

Mr. Spitler stated if the base was installed appropriately, the parking area should hold up. However, if it begins to fail, the applicant will have to address that issue immediately.

MOTION: Mr. Briggs moved to approve the time extensions for Items #3 - #6 as requested by the Dayton Korean Baptist Church, 5051 Wilmington Pike. Should the parking area pavement begin to fail, it shall be repaired immediately. Mr. Brunner seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 7-0.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Paul Clark". The signature is written in dark ink and is positioned to the right of the main text block.