

**CENTERVILLE PLANNING COMMISSION**  
**Regular Meeting**  
**Tuesday, May 31, 2005**

Mr. Clark called the work session to order at 7:30 P.M.

Attendance: Mr. Paul Clark, Chairman; Mr. Jim Briggs; Mr. Jeff Gammell; Mr. Joe Weingarten, and Mr. Jim Brunner. Absent: Mr. James Durham and Mrs. Carolyn Meininger. Also present: Mr. Steve Feverston, City Planner; Mr. Ryan Lee, Planner; Mr. Scott Liberman, Legal Counsel; Mr. Bill Covell, Economic Development Administrator.

Motion to Excuse:

MOTION: Mr. Weingarten moved to excuse Mr. Durham and Mrs. Meininger from the meeting as each gave prior notice to staff. Mr. Briggs seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 5-0.

Approval of minutes:

MOTION: Mr. Briggs moved to approve the Planning Commission Regular Meeting minutes of April 26, 2005, as written. Mr. Weingarten seconded the motion. The motion was approved 4-0-1 with Mr. Brunner abstaining.

**PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**Miami Valley Hospital - Major Use Special Approval, Conditional Use Special Approval, Variance**

Mr. Feverston reviewed the applications submitted by Joann Ringer for Miami Valley Hospital consisting of a Major Use Special Approval application for development of the site located west of Wilmington Pike, south of I-675 and north of Clio Road, including a Conditional Use request for a heliport; and a Variance application for building height. The subject property is divided among two (2) zoning districts. Approximately 93 acres of the site is zoned Business Planned Development, B-PD, and approximately five (5) acres on the northwestern portion of the site is zoned Industrial Planned Development, I-PD.

The request includes the following items:

1. Approval of a Major Use plan for the entire site.
2. Approval of Phase 1 of the Miami Valley South Campus ambulatory center; a 250,000 square foot facility that includes a full service, 24-hour emergency care center; medical imaging services; cardiac diagnostics; breast center; cancer treatment center; laboratory services; a physician office complex; and a single deck parking garage.
3. Approval of a Conditional Use to permit a helipad to be constructed as a part of the Phase 1 development.

Mr. Feverston explained the maximum building height is 45 feet and the applicant is seeking a variance to allow a building height of 100 feet for the proposed 5-story building. This variance, if approved, would allow flexibility in the various design elements of the proposed building and provide the maximum use of the property.

Mr. Feverston reviewed the points contained in the staff analysis:

1. The applicant has demonstrated in their application that there exists practical difficulties with the current height regulations imposed by the Zoning Ordinance that would deprive the applicant reasonable use of this property.
2. The City is in the process of drafting a new Zoning Ordinance to implement the recommendations of "Create the Vision", the City's newly adopted Comprehensive Plan.

Based on those points, staff recommended approval of the Variance request.

Mr. Clark opened the public hearing.

Mr. Larry Helman, NBBJ Architects, stated medical uses require higher floor to floor heights than typical office buildings uses because of the massive heights of some of the equipment utilized by this particular facility.

Mr. Clark asked the roof pitch proposed for the building.

Mr. Larry Helman stated there will be nineteen (19) feet of roof which is the minimum to create a roof-like element and also shield the roof-mounted mechanicals.

There being no speakers, Mr. Clark closed the public hearing.

Mr. Brunner asked if the Fire Department would have any objection to the proposed building height.

Mr. Feverston stated the Fire Department reviewed the plan and have indicated there are no objections to the building height. There are other buildings in the Township that are built to a greater height than the applicant has proposed.

Variance

MOTION: Mr. Briggs moved to approve the Variance requested for Miami Valley Hospital to allow a building height of 100 feet. Mr. Gammell seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 5-0.

Mr. Feverston next reviewed the request for a Major Use and a Conditional Use for Miami Valley Hospital. The first phase of the site will contain approximately 32 acres including the heliport on the overall 98 acre site. At the time Clyo Road was constructed, controlled access points were provided for this property as well as two (2) access points along Wilmington Pike. The applicant has tried to preserve, to the greatest extent possible, the open space on the property. Stands of trees will be preserved along the north and west property lines. A few corridors will provide visibility to the multi-story office building on the site to create a defining entrance into the City as directed in the Create the Vision Master Plan document.

Phase 1 of the project will include the parking garage, multi-story building, cancer center and a portion of the boulevard that will extend throughout the entire development. The main entrance will be located on Wilmington Pike across from an existing church. The heliport will be located on the eastern portion of the site to provide the greatest distance from any residential properties.

The staff analysis included the following points

1. Property slopes from the northwest to the southeast with no significant drainage swales on the site. There exists large wooded areas on the site, particularly to the north along I-675 and in the western portion adjacent to the Thomas Paine and Thomas Paine Woods Condominiums and to South Metro Industrial Park.
2. The proposed major use plan meets the spirit and intent of Study Area B and incorporates much of what is recommended in the City's Comprehensive Plan.
3. The Major Use plan establishes development parcels that specify proposed land uses categories as well as acreage.
4. The plan proposes the establishment of open space/buffer areas that are principally located along the perimeter of the development to help preserve the open space/agrarian character of the site, preserve a significant amount of the existing woodlands, and to establish a view corridor from the I-675 overpass.
5. The proposed Major Use plan shows a network private streets proposed within the development. There is a principal collector road that will connect Wilmington Pike to Clyo Road and all development parcels together.
6. The Phase 1 development plans include a 5-story medical office building, a 2-story diagnostic and treatment/emergency department, a 50,000 square foot cancer center, a 2-level 250 space parking deck, and 1,100 total parking spaces. The cancer center will be developed as a second step of Phase 1.

7. The Phase 1 development has been slightly modified. The plan was rotated approximately 10 degrees clockwise. This modification improves both the functional and aesthetic qualities of the plan. The architecture of the proposed D&T/ED and the medical office buildings was modified to include a pitched roof. This improvement also enhances the aesthetic qualities of the development.
8. A preliminary site access and area roadway analysis was performed by the applicant. The analysis recommends the construction of a southbound right turn lane on Wilmington Pike at the site entrance drive and install a traffic signal at that intersection.
9. The thoroughfare improvements to Wilmington Pike for Phase 1 of the proposed Major Use plan are adequate.
10. Additional right-of-way for both Wilmington Pike and clyo Road is necessary for the future widening of these thoroughfare streets.
11. The proposed helipad is located in a manner that minimizes its impact to the surrounding areas..

Staff recommended approval of the Major Use and Conditional Use applications subject to the following conditions:

1. Additional right-of-way shall be dedicated along Wilmington Pike north of the proposed collector street intersection having a maximum width of twenty-four (24) feet, twelve (12) feet in width south of the proposed collector street and twelve (12) feet in width along Clyo Road, subject to approval by the City Engineer.
2. Wilmington Pike shall be modified to include the construction of a right turn lane at the intersection of the proposed entrance drive and install a traffic signal at this intersection subject to approval by the city Engineering Department.
3. A final traffic impact study shall be conducted for this development subject to approval by the City Engineering Department.
4. Access to individual development parcels shall be provided through the internal street network.
5. All private streets shall be constructed to City standards excepting street width as shown on the Major Use Plan subject to approval by the City Engineering Department.
6. All street names shall be subject to approval by the City Planning Department.
7. A hard surface roadway capable of providing emergency vehicle access and support at all times for emergency purposes shall be provided during construction.

8. A final grading and stormwater drainage plan shall be subject to approval by the City Engineering Department showing drainage calculations and incorporating retention and/ or detention and erosion control during construction in accordance with the City Stormwater Drainage Control Ordinance.
9. An easement shall be recorded to allow for emergency access to all retention/detention basins by the City.
10. The final plans for the proposed cancer center shall be subject to approval by the Planning Commission.
11. A final screening and landscaping plan shall be submitted for each development parcel at the time approval is sought, subject to approval by the Planning Department.
12. A performance bond or other construction guarantee shall be posted by the developer for all landscaping and screening improvements required by the Zoning Ordinance subject to approval by the City Engineer. This bond or guarantee shall be in accordance to the Guarantee of Construction and Installation of Improvements, Inspections Section of Part Twelve, Title Four of the Code of Ordinances.
13. A final exterior lighting plan shall be subject to approval by the City Planning Department.
14. All dumpsters shall be screened using brick and/or stone to match the materials of the building subject to approval by the City Planning Department.

Mr. Clark opened the public hearing.

Ms. Mary Boosalis, Chief Operating Officer of MVH, stated the property for this project was purchased by the hospital in 1986 as well as some additional property in 1990. The development of this facility will relieve some overcrowding at the main campus emergency room and outpatient services. Phase 1 of the total \$73 million project will provide approximately 200,000 square feet of floor space.

Ms. Joann Ringer, Project Manager of MVH South Campus, stated the proposed campus has been designed to create an image to impress the community.

Mr. Larry Helman, NBBJ Architects, stated this is a great opportunity to develop a large piece of property that has remained vacant for this long. The outlots will be developed as health related uses to compliment the major use in the development as well as provide convenience to clients visiting the campus. The health care facility will be located in the center of the site to maximize the flexibility as to how the campus setting will evolve from a health care perspective. A major

campus boulevard will be created that becomes an armature holding the health care related uses to the interior and to the outside additional uses which will flow as one campus to reinforce the single enterprise of the health care business.

Mr. Kim Way, NBBJ Architects, stated that this piece of property with its agricultural nature combined with the wooded areas was something that was a real drive for the design of this site. Phase 1 will include the first part of the ring road from Wilmington Pike that will eventually connect around the campus to Clio Road. A connecting road from Clio Road up to the ring road to provide access to employee parking area, the emergency building, etc., will be constructed in Phase 1 as well. Visitor parking will be located on the north side of the facility and parking for the medical office building will be in a one-level parking ramp and surface parking lot to the west. The 50,000 square foot cancer center is still in the design process and will be submitted to the Planning Commission in the future for review. The building locations on the site have been turned approximately ten (10) degrees to provide better efficiency of the parking elements as well as a better view and appearance as one enters the site from Wilmington Pike. The areas of the site that will not be developed during Phase 1 of the project will be created into a meadow feature to redesign the overall site. The open space along Clio Road will be a feature to remain. There is a stand of trees north of the medical office building that will most likely be preserved forever. To promote this site for pedestrian travel, a walkway system will be identified to provide an area for people to get out and enjoy the campus for its beauty. Directional signage will be used after entering the site to assist people to get to the proper location for their particular needs.

Mr. Weingarten stated the building elevations show the buildings with flat roofs.

Mr. Helman stated those elevations have been revised to provide a roof element and a dome has been added as well.

Mr. Weingarten asked why the ring road extended so far into the wooded area to the north in the vicinity of I-675.

Mr. Helman stated it is designed to allow flexibility for future needs for the hospital. Having the natural geometry of the site maintain the open space and the focus they felt the layout created, a roadway system was extended from the meadow to the woods so people could capitalize on the overall features on the site.

Mr. Gammell asked if any kind of architectural techniques were used to minimize the visual impact of the large buildings to be constructed on this site.

Mr. Helman stated the base of the building will be constructed with a stone material, the body will be brick, and a large amount of the cap will be of stone as well. The larger frames of glass used on the elevations minimize the height of the buildings and the mass appears lighter because of the natural light the glass provides.

Mr. Clark asked how the parking garage would be constructed.

Mr. Helman stated the parking garage will be two (2) levels using the same building materials, however, most of the structure will be underground.

There being no other speakers, Mr. Clark closed the public hearing.

Mr. Weingarten stated perhaps South Metro Parkway should have a turnaround constructed so traffic in that area would not have to back up to access the property.

Mr. Feverston stated the connection of the roadway system to South Metro Parkway is discouraged in the Comprehensive Plan due to the different kinds of traffic that would utilize those points of access. A potential connection could be made as the applicant is leaving that option available, however, a connection is not likely.

#### Major Use Special Approval

MOTION: Mr. Weingarten moved to recommend approval of the Major Use Special Approval application to Council for Miami Valley Hospital subject to the following conditions:

1. Additional right-of-way shall be dedicated along Wilmington Pike north of the proposed collector street intersection having a maximum width of twenty-four (24) feet, twelve (12) feet in width south of the proposed collector street and twelve (12) feet in width along Clio Road, subject to approval by the City Engineer.
2. Wilmington Pike shall be modified to include the construction of a right turn lane at the intersection of the proposed entrance drive and install a traffic signal at this intersection subject to approval by the city Engineering Department.
3. A final traffic impact study shall be conducted for this development subject to approval by the City Engineering Department.
4. Access to individual development parcels shall be provided through the internal street network.
5. All private streets shall be constructed to City standards excepting street width as shown on the Major Use Plan subject to approval by the City Engineering Department.
6. All street names shall be subject to approval by the City Planning Department.
7. A hard surface roadway capable of providing emergency vehicle access and support at all times for emergency purposes shall be provided during construction.

8. A final grading and stormwater drainage plan shall be subject to approval by the City Engineering Department showing drainage calculations and incorporating retention and/ or detention and erosion control during construction in accordance with the City Stormwater Drainage .Control Ordinance.
9. An easement shall be recorded to allow for emergency access to all retention/detention basins by the City.
10. The final plans for the proposed cancer center shall be subject to approval by the Planning Commission.
11. A final screening and landscaping plan shall be submitted for each development parcel at the time approval is sought, subject to approval by the Planning Department.
12. A performance bond or other construction guarantee shall be posted by the developer for all landscaping and screening improvements required by the Zoning Ordinance subject to approval by the City Engineer. This bond or guarantee shall be in accordance to the Guarantee of Construction and Installation of Improvements, Inspections Section of Part Twelve, Title Four of the Code of Ordinances.
13. A final exterior lighting plan shall be subject to approval by the City Planning Department.
14. All dumpsters shall be screened using brick and/or stone to match the materials of the building subject to approval by the City Planning Department.

Mr. Briggs seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 5-0.

#### Conditional Use Special Approval

MOTION: Mr. Gammell moved to approve the Conditional Use application to Council for Miami Valley Hospital permitting the use of a heliport as requested. Mr. Briggs seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 5-0.

#### Cambria, Jason (Primrose Daycare) - Variance of Fence Height in Front Yard

Mr. Feverston reviewed the Variance by Jason Cambria, representing Primrose Daycare, for a Variance of fence height in the front yard of a property located west of Wilmington Pike along East Alex-Bell Road across from Planet Ford. The zoning on the property is Business Planned Development, B-PD. The applicant is requesting a six (6) foot fence and the standard is four (4) feet.



Mr. Feverston reviewed the following points included in the staff analysis:

1. The applicant states in their application that the purpose for the fence is to permit children attending the day care to play in the front yard adjacent to the public street that will be platted and constructed as a part of their development.
2. The applicant also states that the proposed fence will not extend into the front yard adjacent to Alex-Bell Road.
3. The applicant is showing a proposed mound that extends partially into the future public right-of-way with landscaping on top for the purpose of screening the fence from the public view. The mound, having a width of approximately six (6) feet would only provide about one (1) foot of height and would not be wide enough to accomplish what the applicant intends.
4. The applicant has not stated any evidence that there is any hardship or practical difficulty associated with the parcel that would deprive the applicant reasonable use of the property.

Based on those points, staff recommended the Variance be denied.

Mr. Weingarten asked if the State had a minimum fence height requirement for day care uses.

Mr. Feverston stated he was unaware of a requirement, however, the applicant might possibly know if a State standard exists.

Mr. Clark opened the public hearing.

Mr. Jason Cambria, applicant, and Mr. Jim Alt, architect for the project, were present for the review of the request.

Mr. Alt stated they did not believe there was a State fence height requirement for day care facilities, however, the Primrose franchise does have a six (6) foot fence height requirement. He stated the children would benefit from having a larger area to run and play. Further, the safety of the children is an issue concerning security. The proposed fence would be constructed of wrought iron which is consistent with other fence structures used throughout the city. Mr. Alt stated that in casual discussions with Council, there have been comments as to why the applicant would want to screen the fence structure with a mound since it would be attractive. He stated he hoped the Planning Commission would consider this request in a compelling way.

There being no other speaker, Mr. Clark closed the public hearing.

Mr. Briggs stated it has to be remembered that the fence is to serve the purpose of not allowing access from the outside to the inside and vice versa.

Mr. Gammell stated he felt security and safety could create enough of a hardship to warrant the granting of the variance.

Mr. Weingarten stated he felt the zoning regulations did not really allow the Planning Commission to grant the request, but strongly recommended the applicant appeal the decision to Council should the request be denied.

Mr. Feverston stated that regardless of State regulations that might require a six (6) foot fence height, there are other locations on this site that it could be installed and meet the Zoning Ordinance requirements. He stated the real question is to allow pushing the play area towards the public street.

MOTION: Mr. Briggs moved to approve the Variance application for Front Yard Fence Height requested by Jason Cambria for Primrose Day Care. Mr. Gammell seconded the motion. The motion was denied with Mr. Clark, Mr. Weingarten and Mr. Brunner voting no.

Mr. Feverston informed the applicant of the appeal process.

#### NEW BUSINESS

##### Centerville Benjamin Robbins Plat, Sec. 1 - Record Plan

Mr. Feverston reviewed the Record Plan for the Centerville Benjamin Robbins Plat, Sec. 1, located on North Main Street north of West Franklin Street. The zoning on the 1.3588 acre parcel is Architectural Preservation District, APD. The request is to subdivide this property into three (3) lots. Lot #1 is to be owned by a proposed restaurant user; Lot #2 will be owned by the City of Centerville for public parking, and Lot #3 is the location of Township Hall owned by Washington Township. Mr. Feverston stated this is a joint project between the City and Township.

Staff recommended approval of the Record Plan as submitted.

MOTION: Mr. Briggs moved to recommend approval of the Record Plan for the Centerville Benjamin Robbins Plat, Sec. 1, to Council. Mr. Weingarten seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 5-0.

#### COMMUNICATIONS

Mr. Feverston stated copies of proposed ordinance amendments had been distributed in the information packets to the members and ask for written comments as soon as possible.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

