

CENTERVILLE PLANNING COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
Tuesday, July 27, 1993

Mr. Hosfeld called the meeting to order at 7:30 P.M.

Attendance: Mr. Robert Hosfeld, Chairman; Mr. James Durham; Mr. Scot Stone; Mr. Peter McMahon; Mr. Bernard Samples. Absent: Mr. Arthur Foland; Mr. Stanley Swartz.. Also present: Mr. Alan Schwab, City Planner; Mr. Steve Feverston, Assistant City Planner; Mr. Dave Eubank, Attorney.

MOTION: Mr. Durham moved to excuse Mr. Foland and Mr. Swartz from the meeting as each gave notice to staff. Mr. Stone seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 5-0.

Approval of minutes:

MOTION: Mr. Samples moved to approve the Planning Commission minutes of July 13, 1993, as written. Mr. McMahon seconded the motion. The motion was approved 3-0-2 with Mr. Hosfeld and Mr. Durham abstaining.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

M & M Development Company (Lowe's) - Major Use/Conditional Use

Mr. Schwab reviewed the Major Use and Conditional Use applications submitted by M & M Development Company to construct a Lowe's Home Improvement Center to be located on the southwest corner of Wilmington Pike and Whipp Road. The zoning on the 22.6 acre parcel is Business Planned Development, B-PD. The property is abutted to the west by the Fox Run Condominium development, I-675 to the south, Wilmington Pike to the east and the new SuperAmerica facility to the north. The proposed building is a light brick color on all sides of the building with some dryvit areas and trimmed with some smooth face concrete block painted blue with a red stripe, a turned metal roof and dark gray trim.

A conditional use application was also filed to allow the garden center on the north end of the proposed building. Sign variances are also a part of the application. The Sign Ordinance permits one (1) ground sign for the site, 32 sq. ft. per side for a total of 64 sq. ft., and can have a sign height of 10 ft. placed at a 20 ft. setback. The applicant has requested two (2) ground signs, 64 sq. ft. per side for a total sign area of 128 sq. ft., and have a sign height of 20 ft. at a 20 ft. setback. One (1) sign would be located at the entrance along Wilmington Pike and the second sign at the entrance along Whipp Road. Mr. Schwab stated that a sign variance was granted for Centerville Place shopping center with approximately the same situation as proposed by M & M Development.

The proposed building size for the Lowe's facility is 121,148 sq. ft. of gross floor area (GFA), and required 5.5 parking spaces per 1,000 sq. ft. of GFA. The applicant has proposed 5.51 spaces per 1,000 sq. ft. of GFA excluding the 1.78 acre outlot. Road improvements will be required to Wilmington Pike as a part of this development. The wrought iron fencing area around the garden center and the wall to the rear of the building are to be 20 ft. in height.

The approval of the Major Use application reviewed by the City in 1990, and was approved for 125,000 to 127,000 sq. ft. of retail commercial area, with the southeast corner of the site was to be a detention basin for stormwater control purposed, pine trees being added for screening to the adjoining residences, a security fence to be located behind the shopping center and to the south of the shopping center to provide a barrier for pedestrians traveling between the shopping center and the residential neighborhood to the west. This plan expired after a two (2) year period.

Staff recommended to approve the Major Use/Conditional Use and Sign Variance applications subject to the following conditions:

1. A market analysis shall be submitted by the developer to the City providing evidence that the shopping center will be economically viable.
2. The required 100 foot buffer strip along the west and south property lines abutting Fox Run Condominiums shall be maintained in its natural state except that a stormwater retention/detention basin in the southeast corner of the site within the buffer strip shall be permitted and the swale shown on the grading plan in the southwestern portion of the site behind the Lowe's building shall be permitted. Any work in the 100 foot buffer strip shall be in accordance with plans approved by the City Planning and Engineering Departments. Additional evergreen landscape screening shall be planted in the buffer strip along the service driveway behind the south and west side of the Lowe's building. Detailed landscape plans for this screening shall be subject to approval by the Planning Department. A solid wooden privacy fence of a design approved by the Planning Department shall be required along the west and south sides of the Lowe's building to limit pedestrian access to the Fox Run Condominium properties.
3. Dumpster location, containers and concealment with the required screening shall be approved by the City Planning Department.
4. Landscape screening shall be required that minimizes the view from Whipp Road of the truck unloading area on the northwest corner of the Lowe's building.

5. Deliveries and the removal of refuse to the Lowe's building shall be restricted to between the hours of 8:00 AM and 5:00 PM.
6. All exterior lighting shall be approved by the City Planning Department.
7. The non-emergency use of an outdoor speaker system for paging, music, advertising or any other purpose shall be prohibited.
8. The applicant shall provide to the City Engineer appropriate evidence that they have adequately addressed any potential Federal Wetland requirements.
9. A stormwater drainage plans shall be approved by the City Engineering Department showing stormwater drainage calculations and incorporating retention and/or detention and erosion control during construction in accordance with the provisions of the City Stormwater Drainage Control Ordinance.
10. Adequate covenants approved by the City Attorney shall be recorded to provide for the future private maintenance of the proposed stormwater retention basin. These recorded covenants shall specifically permit emergency maintenance and access by the City in a manner approved by the City Attorney.
11. The southern driveway to Wilmington Pike shall be restricted to prohibit left turns from the Lowe's site to Wilmington Pike in accordance with detailed plans approved by the City Engineer. If approved by the State of Ohio and the City Engineer, the raised median on Wilmington Pike may be modified to permit left turns from Wilmington Pike into this Lowe's driveway. The cost for this modification to Wilmington Pike shall be paid by the applicant.
12. In lieu of the standard City requirement that the developer add an additional lane of pavement, curb, gutter, stormwater drainage and sidewalk along Wilmington Pike in accordance with plans approved by the City Engineering Department, the developer shall pay to the City an amount of money approved by the City Engineer that is the estimated cost of making the above improvements. This entire amount of money shall be used by the City to pay for a part of the Wilmington Pike widening project which is presently under construction. The cost of any modification to Wilmington Pike to permit a left turn lane to be constructed from Wilmington Pike into the Lowe's driveway shall be deducted from the above-estimated amount for the one lane widening improvement.

13. The City shall specifically approve the use of dryvit (a synthetic stucco material) on the east side of the building and the partial use of painted smooth finish concrete block (CMU - concrete masonry unit) on the walls of the building.
14. The wall sign on the front of the Lowe's building facing Wilmington Pike is specifically not being approved. This sign must comply in size with the wall sign requirements of the City Zoning Ordinance. the ground (pylon) sign variances requested along Whipp Road and along Wilmington Pike are approved as requested.
15. The outdoor storage, sale or display of any materials shall be specifically prohibited except within the wrought iron fenced garden center on the north side of the Lowe's building and within the solid brick fenced area shown on the southwest side of the Lowe's building. Temporary sidewalk sales permitted within the City Zoning Ordinance are an exception to this provision.

Mr. Hosfeld opened the public hearing.

Mr. Jim Girard, M & M Development Company representing Lowe's, presented a video and slides featuring their proposed facility. He stated that Lowe's has 350 stores in 21 states of which this building would be only the third of brick construction. Mr. Girard stated that the proposed plans have been amended slightly to allow for the greenhouse structures in the garden area and having them backed up with the wrought iron fencing to the rear of those structures. He stated that the construction loan for the project is approximately \$7 million. In addition, the Lowe's investment in the facility excluding merchandise is approximately \$4 million. Construction related jobs during the 10-month construction period is approximately 250-300 jobs and approximately 150 permanent jobs after the store is open. The payroll is approximately \$2.4 million annually for this type of store. Projected sales for a store such as the one being proposed is \$20 million annually.

Mr. McMahon asked if a market analysis will be prepared as required by the standards in the Zoning Ordinance.

Mr. Girard stated that a market analysis has been prepared by Lowe's, however, they will not share it with M & M Development. He stated that it is a highly competitive marketplace and the Lowe's people are not at liberty to share that information at this point in time. He stated it will be made available to the City when it becomes available to M & M Development.

Mr. Girard stated that they wish to use a chain link fence rather than a wooden privacy fence with an approximate budget of \$100,000 of additional landscaping to be placed to the rear of the property. He stated that he felt the chain link would be better maintained and would not be visible to the residents after a short period of time with the vegetation in that area. Wood construction could be a maintenance nightmare and the security it would achieve is not what they are looking for.

Mr. Girard reviewed some points in the staff recommendations that were of concern. The condition (#5) concerning the hours of refuse removal and deliveries are too restrictive and requested that they be changed to 7:00 AM to 9:00 PM. The condition (#7) regarding the paging system was a concern as a paging system is an essential operating tool and all equipment is mounted within the building walls so it would be very difficult to hear offsite. Paging will only be in the garden area other than in the main building. The final concern was a question as to how the sign area is calculated. Mr. Girard stated that the blue area behind the Lowe's sign is an architectural feature and if a wall sign was not permitted, the blue would still be there which is part of the identity of the building and not part of the sign. He stated that he could work this issue out with staff at a later date.

Mr. James Price, 5865 Overbrooke Road, was concerned with several aspects of the project. He questioned the width of the buffer strip and what affect the utilities in that buffer strip would have in that area; the re-routing of the creek from north to south and would the woods be disturbed; what type of security fence would be installed; and, suggested "No Trespassing" signs be installed in the buffer strip. He asked if the current roadway system is capable of handling the increase in traffic this project will generate. He indicated that making a left-turn from the project onto Whipp Road is a traffic hazard as a result of improper sight distance. Mr. Price asked if Greene County had been involved in the review of this project as it affects Wilmington Pike and if deliveries would be made from Wilmington Pike or the service road from Whipp Road. He was concerned about the noise that this project would create for the neighborhood. Mr. Price agreed with the staff recommendation to restrict the delivery and trash removal hours from 8:00 AM to 5:00 PM, and requested that the parking lot lighting be down-directed in so that residences are not affected. He further suggested that the trees along the marginal ground be raised to better screen the site from the residences. Mr. Price asked what type of security system would be installed and if the ground signage proposed would be the same on Wilmington Pike as it would be on Whipp Road.

Mr. Lee Hall, 2591 Old Whipp Court, was in opposition to the request by M & M Development. He felt the application was defective as the market analysis was not made as part of the submittal. The traffic problems are numerous and will only be increased as a result of this development. In addition, the light and noise problems created will be a detriment to the surrounding neighborhood. Mr. Hall stated that he was concerned with the B-PD zoning classification placed on this property and the possible intensity it could cause to the residential developments in the immediate area. Mr. Hall also complained of the weed growth on the property. A copy of the petition originally submitted in 1990 was submitted to Planning Commission by Mr. Hall.

Mr. George Catterlin, 2711 Kings Arm Circle, was concerned about how much encroachment would be necessary in the buffer strip to provide for the relocated swale. He suggested that the brick color be more compatible to the surrounding residential neighborhood and that the chain link fence be denied. Mr. Catterlin asked if environmental impact statements are required for wetlands, noise and lighting as all elements will create pollution to the area. He agreed that the delivery hours should be limited as suggested by staff. He stated that he is not anti-business, but would like conditions placed on the approval to address the concerns of the residents.

Mr. Howard Kathman, 5884 Overbrooke Road, felt that the site distance along Whipp Road is not adequate in the area of the proposed service road. He suggested that pole buildings not be permitted on the site and the mechanical equipment on the roof area be screened with wood fencing which was a original condition of Council in the 1990 application. Mr. Kathman stated further that a wooden fence structure is a better sound barrier than the proposed chain link fencing material.

Mr. Albert Dexter, 5831 Overbrooke Road, was concerned about the separate contractors' section for purchasing materials and asked if there will be sawing outside which would create a noise problem to the surrounding neighborhood.

Mrs. Denise Jacobs, 2561 E. Whipp Road, was opposed to the project. She indicated that a market survey should be submitted as this proposal does not make sense in light of the WPAFB cutbacks and the closing of DESC.

Mr. Jeff Jacobs, 2561 E. Whipp Road, felt that this site is not appropriate for business and would be more appropriate for office park development.

Ms. Ann Hall, 2719 Kings Arm Circle, stated that the elevation of the buffer strip is not high enough and a wooden fence should be required. She was further concerned about the traffic congestion and how it will create air pollution which will lead to the killing of trees.

There being no other speakers, Mr. Hosfeld closed the public hearing.

Mr. Samples stated that he was not comfortable in giving any further consideration to this matter until a market survey has been submitted as is required in the Zoning Ordinance. Since that is the first condition in the staff recommendations, he did not see how they could proceed without it.

Mr. Durham agreed with Mr. Samples that a market survey is necessary in order to further review this application.

Mr. Samples asked if it would be in order to table the application.

Mr. Eubank indicated that it would be in order if the Planning Commission so wished since the market analysis is part of the application required by the Zoning Ordinance.

Mr. Girard agreed to table the application with an extension of the City review time until such a time that a market analysis is submitted to the City.

MOTION: Mr. Samples moved to table the Major Use/Condition Use applications until a market analysis is submitted to the City. Mr. McMahon seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 5-0.

Mr. Girard stated that Lowe's is coming to this area whether it is on this site or at another location. He stated that this particular property is a good one and will be developed at some point in time. He stated that it should be kept in mind that a different development on this property could have more of an impact on the surrounding area than his proposal.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

File follow 8/10/93

RECEIVED

JUL 27 1993

CITY OF CENTERVILLE
PLANNING DEPT.

CENTERVILLE PLANNING COMMISSION
CITY OF CENTERVILLE, OHIO

RECEIVED

JUL 10 1990

CITY OF CENTERVILLE
PLANNING DEPT.

WE THE UNDERSIGNED ARE OPPOSED TO MAJOR USE APPROVAL
REQUEST OF MARATHON PETROLEUM COMPANY (REVEAL PLAN) AND FINKE
REALTY COMPANY FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF 22.58 ACRES AT THE SOUTH-
WEST CORNER OF WHIPP ROAD AND WILMINGTON PIKE FOR A SHOPPING
CENTER AND SPEEDWAY FILLING STATION.....

- July 8, 90 W. Seland Hall 2591 Old Whipp Ct. Centerville, Oh 45444
- 7-8-90 Pauline C. Hall 2591 old whipp ct. Centerville
- 7-8-90 Betty L. Blose 2635 Old Whipp Ct. Centerville
- 2-8-90 Byron L. Blose 2635 Old Whipp Ct. Centerville, Oh 45440
- 7/8/90 J. C. Beard 2705 Old Whipp Ct Centerville, Oh
- 7/8/90 Elee Arnold 2705 Old Whipp Ct. Centerville, Ohio 45440
- 7/8/90 Stephen Masier 2727 Old Whipp Ct. Centerville, Ohio 45440
- 7/8/90 Dejean S. Jacobs 2561 E. Whipp Rd Centerville, Oh 45444
- 7/8/90 Jeff Jacobs 2561 E. Whipp Rd Centerville, Oh 45440
- 7-8-90 Barbara Lynn 5893 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh 45440
- 8 JUL 90 John R. Williams 2500 Montbelle Cir Kettering, Ohio 45424
- 7/8/90 Glenn E. Williams 2500 Montbelle Cir Kettering, Ohio 45424
- 7/8/90 Edward L. Hennessey 5891 Overbrook Rd. Centerville, Ohio 45440
- 7/8/90 Robert L. Hennessey 5857 Overbrook
- 7/8/90 Mary E. Mahan 5885 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Ohio 45440
- 7/8/90 Patricia A. Galum 5885 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Ohio 45440
- 7/8/90 Robert L. Shere 5883 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Ohio 45440
- 7/8/90 Ronald A. Steel 5871 Overbrook, Centerville, Oh
- 7/8/90 Bill Conway 5869 Overbrook, Centerville, Oh
- 7/8/90 Peter Conway 5867 Overbrook, Centerville, Oh
- 7/8/90 Marjorie Vance 5845 Overbrook Rd Centerville
- 7/8/90 Laura Duffin 7409A Bergetac Ct. Centerville
- 7/8/90 Gloria Horn 460 Centergrove Rd Centerville
- 7-8-90 Marilyn Joyce 5863 Overbrook Centerville
- 7-8-90 Mari Lou Moore 2634 Kings Arms Centerville
- 7-8-90 Marjorie Craver 8207 " " Circle Centerville
- 7-8-90 Jonathan Wolfe 5894 Overbrook Rd Centerville
- 7-8-90 Mark Fisher 5904 Overbrook Rd Centerville
- 7-8-90 Krista Straker 5904 Overbrook Rd Centerville
- 7-8-90 L. Sch 5944 " " " "

- 4544

7-8-90 Arlene Mauder 5755 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh
7/5/90 Scott A. Arump 5851 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh
7/8/90 Katherine J. Walker 5849 Overbrook Rd. Centerville, Oh -
7/5/90 Laura L. Allen 5845 Overbrook Rd. Centerville, Ohio
7/8/90 David Allen 5845 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh.
7/9/90 Marilyn Scott 5823 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh
2/9/90 Wilma K. Clapp 5821 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh
7/9/90 Marynie M. Latta 5779 Overbrook Rd. Kettering O.
7/8/90 Mrs. Latta 5779 Overbrook Rd. Kettering O.
7/8/90 Mrs. Marion Johnson 5814 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh.
7/8/90 Nancy J. Schiffer 5865 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh
7/8/90 Vera Dover 5937 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh
7/8/90 Alf Don 5934 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh
7/8/90 Snaf. Sr. Bennett 5944 Overbrook Rd. Centerville Ohio
7/8/90 Shirley Bennett 5944 Overbrook Rd. Centerville Ohio
7/8/90 Jack C. Perry 5412 Haxton Dr Centerville Ohio
7/8/90 Janice R. Perry 5412 Haxton Dr. Centerville, Ohio
7/8/90 Roy C. Young 5401 Haxton Dr. Centerville, Ohio
7/10/90 Gladys Nickel 2618 Millbridge Centerville, Oh
7/10/90 Willis J. Nickel 2618 Millbridge Centerville, Oh
7/10/90 Helen M. Clark 2612 Millbridge Ct. Centerville, Ohio
7/10/90 John V. Clark 2612 MILLBRIDGE CT. CENTERVILLE OH

Circulated and presented by W. L. Hall
2591 Old Whipp Ct. Centerville, Oh 45440

RECEIVED

JUL 27 1993

CITY OF CENTERVILLE
PLANNING DEPT.

CENTERVILLE PLANNING COMMISSION
CITY OF CENTERVILLE, OHIO

RECEIVED

JUL 10 1990

CITY OF CENTERVILLE
PLANNING DEPT.

WE THE UNDERSIGNED ARE OPPOSED TO MAJOR USE ZONING APPROVAL
REQUEST OF MARATHON PETROLEUM COMPANY (REVISED PLAN) AND FINKE
REALTY COMPANY FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF 22.58 ACRES AT THE SOUTH-
WEST CORNER OF WHIPP ROAD AND WILMINGTON PIKE FOR A SHOPPING
CENTER AND SPEEDWAY FILLING STATION.....

- July 8, 90 W. Ireland Hall 2591 Old Whipp Ct. Centerville, Oh 45440
- 7-8-90 Pauline C. Hall 2591 old whipp ct. Centerville
- 7-8-90 Betty L. Blose 2635 Old Whipp Ct. Centerville
- 2-8-90 Byron L. Blose 2635 old whipp ct. Centerville, Oh 45440
- 7/8/90 J. C. Card 2705 Old Whipp Ct Centerville, Ohio
- 7/8/90 Elsie Ireland 2705 Old Whipp Ct. Centerville, Ohio
- 7/8/90 Stephen Gasior 2727 Old Whipp Ct. Centerville, Ohio
- 7/8/90 Denise D. Dubs 2561 E. Whipp Rd Centerville, Ohio 45440
- 7/8/90 Jeff Jacinto 2561 E. Whipp Rd Centerville, Ohio 45440
- 7-8-90 Barbara Kay 5893 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh 45440
- 8 JUL 90 John R. Williams 2500 Montbelle Cir Kettering, Ohio 45424
- 7/8/90 Glenn E. Williams 2500 Montbelle Cir Kettering, Ohio 45424
- 7/8/90 Edward L. Hennessey 5891 Overbrook Rd. Centerville, Ohio 45440
- 7/8/90 Robert L. Hennessey 5887 Overbrook
- 7/8/90 Mary D. Galvin 5885 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Ohio 45440
- 7/8/90 Patricia A. Galvin 5885 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Ohio 45440
- 7/8/90 Robert L. Share 5883 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Ohio 45440
- 7/8/90 Ronald A. Steel 5871 Overbrook, Centerville, Ohio
- 7/8/90 Bill Conway 5869 Overbrook, Centerville, Ohio
- 7/8/90 Ruth Ann 5867 Overbrook Centerville
- 7/8/90 John 5865 Overbrook Centerville
- 7/8/90 Marjorie J. Jance 5845 Overbrook Rd Centerville
- 7/8/90 Laina Duffin 7409A Bergerac Ct. Centerville
- 7/8/90 Gloria J. Jow 460 Centeregrove Rd Centerville
- 7-8-90 Marilyn Joyce 5863 Overbrook Centerville
- 7-8-90 Thari Lee Moore 2634 Kings Arms Centerville
- 7-8-90 Marjorie Craver 8207 " " Circle Centerville
- 7-8-90 Jonathan Wolfe 5894 Overbrook rd Centerville
- 7-8-90 Mark Fisher 5904 Overbrook Rd Centerville.
- 7-8-90 Kristie Straker 5904 Overbrook Rd Centerville
- 7-8-90 L. Sch 5904 " " " "

- 7-8-90 Arlene Mauder 5755 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh
- 7/5/90 Scott P. Brump 5851 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh
- 7/8/90 Kathleen J. Walker 5849 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh -
- 7/8/90 Laura L. Allen 5845 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Ohio
- 7/8/90 Gerald Allen 5845 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh.
- 7/9/90 Marilyn Scott 5823 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh
- 7/9/90 Wilma K. Cliff 5821 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh
- 7/9/90 Maurine M. Jetter 5999 Overbrook Rd. Kettering O.
- 7/8/90 James Jetter 5779 Overbrook Rd. Kettering O.
- 7/8/90 Mrs. Marion Johnson 5814 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh.
- 7/8/90 Nancy J. Schutte 5865 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh
- 7/8/90 Gina Dover 5934 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh
- 7/8/90 Jeff Don 5934 Overbrook Rd Centerville, Oh
- 7/8/90 Soap Sr. Bennett 5944 Overbrook Rd. Centerville Ohio
- 7/8/90 Shirley Bennett 5944 Overbrook Rd. Centerville Ohio
- 7/8/90 Jack C. Perry 5412 Haxton Dr Centerville Ohio
- 7/8/90 Janice R. Perry 5412 Haxton Dr. Centerville, Ohio
- 7/8/90 Ray C. Young 5401 Haxton Dr. Centerville, Ohio
- 7/10/90 Gladys Nickel 2618 Millbridge Centerville, Oh
- 7/10/90 Willis J. Nickel 2618 Millbridge Centerville, Oh
- 7/10/90 Helen M. Clark 2612 Millbridge Ct. Centerville, Ohio
- 7/10/90 John V. Clark 2612 MILLBRIDGE CT. CENTERVILLE OH

Circulated and presented by W. L. Hall
 2591 Old Whipp Ct. Centerville, Oh 45440