

Heidi M. Miller
1.7.09

BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
Regular Meeting
Tuesday, June 2, 2009

Ms. Miller called the meeting to order at 7:30 P.M.

Attendance: Ms. Heidi Miller, Chair; Mrs. Laverne Stebbins; Mr. James Treffinger; Mr. Frank Holloway; Mr. Jaime Garrett. Absent: Mr. Charles Graham and Mr. Bill Etson. Also present: Mr. Ryan Lee, Planner; Mr. Steve Feverston, City Planner; Mr. John Sliemers, Assistant City Engineer.

Motion to Excuse:

MOTION: Mrs. Stebbins moved to excuse Mr. Graham from the meeting as he gave prior notice to staff. Mr. Garrett seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 5-0.

Approval of Minutes:

MOTION: Mrs. Stebbins moved to approve the Board of Architectural Review Regular Meeting minutes of January 6, 2009, as written. Mr. Holloway seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 5-0.

NEW BUSINESS

David Ellinger - Minor Site Plan

Mr. Lee reviewed Application #84 submitted by Jan and David Ellinger requesting approval of a Minor Site Plan for property located at 107 East Franklin Street in the Architectural Preservation District (APD). The applicants are proposing a building addition to the existing residence and dental practice building as well as an attached garage. Over the last year, the residents have worked extensively refinishing the exterior of the building and doing a lot of maintenance work to improve the aesthetics of the property. The house is a home for Dr. Ellinger's dental practice as well as his future retirement home for himself and his wife. The proposed addition to the house are for the residential portion of the structure. The bedroom addition will be situated on the back of the existing building along the west side and the garage directly to the east of the bedroom addition. A decking area will be constructed directly north of the bedroom addition. The existing parking area for the dental practice will not be affected, however, there will be a paver system installed prior to the garage addition as well as a pedestrian walkway to accommodate patients entering the dental office.

The proposed elevations appropriately mimic the rhythm of the wall openings and the style of the existing building. The materials to be used on the addition include hardi-board siding and a fiber cement trim. The exterior colors of the addition will match those used on the existing building. A foundation covering is to be used around the entire building to mimic some of the early limestone foundations found within the APD.

The Planning Department recommended approval subject to the following conditions:

1. The faux stone foundation covering shall match the profile and coursing typical of early limestone foundations located throughout the AP District subject to approval by the City Planning Department.
2. The design of the driveway and parking lot shall be subject to approval by the City Engineering Department. Specifically, the driveway shall have a minimum width of 14 feet and the parking lot shall have a minimum width of 58 feet should a handicapped parking space be required on site.
3. The existing driveway approach shall remain undisturbed.
4. The proposed walkway shall have a minimum width of 5 feet, terminate south of the garage approach area, and include a handicapped ramp on the north terminus subject to approval by the City Engineering Department.
5. A final grading and stormwater drainage plan shall be subject to approval by the City Engineering Department in accordance with Section 9.35 of the Unified Development Ordinance.

Dr. David Ellinger, applicant currently residing at 204 Zengel Drive, and Mr. Alex Luque, project architect, was present for the review of the project. They asked for clarification to the reference of the ADA standards concerning the walkway.

Mr. Lee stated the reference to the ADA standards was concerning the access from the parking area to the sidewalk that extends to the front porch area on the existing structure.

Dr. Ellinger asked if the faux stone could be installed in phases with the south and east elevations being done during the construction of the building addition and the remaining elevations done at a later time based on the budget costs of the project.

Mr. Garrett stated he would rather the stone be done all at once or not at all rather than having it occur in phases and the finished product not be consistent in color or texture. He stated the two double-hung windows being added to the front of the existing building is very appealing and provide a nice appearance to the building. He asked if the shutters were wood.

Dr. Ellinger stated the existing shutters were vinyl and it was intention to match the existing shutters on the building to keep it consistent in appearance.

The members agreed the shutters should remain consistent in appearance.

MOTION: Mr. Treffinger moved to approve the Major Site Plan submitted by Jan and David Ellinger for property located at 107 East Franklin Street concerning a building addition to the existing structure subject to the following conditions:

1. The faux stone foundation covering shall match the profile and coursing typical of early limestone foundations located throughout the AP District subject to approval by the City Planning Department. Further, the City Planning Department shall approve the location of the faux stone and the phasing of the installation of the faux stone at that time.
2. The design of the driveway and parking lot shall be subject to approval by the City Engineering Department. Specifically, the driveway shall have a minimum width of 14 feet and the parking lot shall have a minimum width of 58 feet should a handicapped parking space be required on site.
3. The existing driveway approach shall remain undisturbed.
4. The proposed walkway shall have a minimum width of 5 feet, terminate south of the garage approach area, and include a handicapped ramp on the north terminus subject to approval by the City Engineering Department.
5. A final grading and stormwater drainage plan shall be subject to approval by the City Engineering Department in accordance with Section 9.35 of the Unified Development Ordinance.

Mr. Holloway seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 5-0.

Tom Otachel/Sona Centerville, LLC - Minor Site Plan

Mr. Lee reviewed Application #97 submitted by Tom Otachel of Sona Centerville, LLC, for a Minor Site Plan requesting approval to install the required landscape bufferyard including an evergreen hedge and privacy fence, construct a retaining wall for the existing deck and ramp at 235 West Franklin Street, and re-construct the parking lot for the same property. The subject property is located within the Architectural Preservation District, APD, and is part of an overall development plan for both 235 and 255 West Franklin Street.

The applicant has also submitted a Major Site Plan for the subject properties that will be reviewed by the Board of Architectural Review (BAR) at the July 7, 2009 Regular Meeting. The Major Site Plan proposes the construction of a 2-story retail building (LA Tan), parking lot and all necessary appurtenances. This request is a re-submission of the development plan approved by the BAR on July 18, 2006 and expired on April 9, 2009.

Mr. Lee stated what staff basically is recommending is only approval of the northern curb line as well as the landscaping and fencing to be installed. All other items should be removed from the Minor Site Plan and included in the Major Site Plan application to be reviewed in July.

Mr. Bill Apple, Project Manager, stated he was recently hired to complete this project and in meeting with staff several weeks ago, they determined the project should be divided into 2 applications to complete the work on the construction sites. He stated their first goal is to get the surrounding properties visually protected from the construction site and to get 235 West Franklin Street "whole" again. In speaking with some of the neighbors, he stated he understood their frustration in the site being in its current condition for some time. He stated he undertook this project when the permits expired, so it is their intent to get the approvals necessary to move the project forward. Mr. Apple stated they are proposing to do more to the property at 235 West Franklin Street by securing the deck posts and put in a pressure-treated retaining wall to complete the deck structure. After that is complete, the curb could be installed which is approximately 2 feet from the retaining wall and that area could be graded accordingly. He stated if those items could not be accomplished, the property at 235 West Franklin Street would remain in disarray. Until the Major Site Plan is reviewed in July, it would mean the work could not begin until the end of July or early August.

Ms. Miller stated she agreed with staff that the application should be separated by focusing on the landscaping, buffering and fencing as an initial phase and come in with the grading and curbing later in the phasing process. She stated the BAR is aware of the history on this site over the last few years, but also understood Mr. Apple was not involved until the present time. The main concern of the members at this time is the tolerance and frustration the neighbors have dealt with for a long period of time and it is the focus of the BAR to provide the property landscaping and buffering applications to the neighboring properties as a priority. She stated as a group, the members would feel more comfortable in taking the project one step at a time in the phasing of the project and being assured it is done properly the first time. Ms. Miller asked if the deck structure would be stable enough to wait to be secured for a couple of months in order to complete the improvements to the north property line first.

Mr. Apple stated it is evident people are entering and exiting the building at 235 West Franklin Street and it is important to have the deck secured to avoid any injury. He stated the deck could be secured without installing the curbing should that be the desire of the members.

Mr. Feverston stated the sidewalk and retaining wall could be installed should the members desire, however, at the time 235 West Franklin Street has a user to occupy the building, the owner may be required to make the sidewalk ADA compliant.

Mr. Garrett asked what type of wood would be used for the fence structure.

Mr. Apple stated it would be some type of cedar fencing material.

Mrs. Stebbins asked when this portion of the project is scheduled to begin.

Mr. Apple stated it will begin as soon as approval is granted.

Mr. Holloway asked why staff divided the project into different applications.

Mr. Lee stated it was divided to have all the construction components underway after the screening and buffering elements were installed to protect the neighbors from further frustration.

Mr. Feverston stated there are also practical concerns of the Engineering Department concerning the drainage issues on the site and to make sure both sites work together and will not have to be redone at the time the LA Tan site is developed.

Mr. Ken Volrath, 234 West Ridgeway Road, stated some of his concerns have been addressed during the meeting. He requested the City notice the adjoining residents of future meetings concerning this project. He stated at one time when the original foundation was installed, one of the plumbers residing in the neighborhood was asked to submit a quote for work, however, there were no plans available. He felt he did not understand how work could have begun without an approved plan. Mr. Volrath stated many different contractors have been on the site and have quit because they are not getting paid. His concern was if there is enough money to complete the project since it seems there are already financial difficulties.

Ms. Miller stated the City has no real knowledge of the financial situation, however, having heard the same information the City is requiring the phasing schedule of the project as well as bonds to be assured the work will be completed on the site.

Mr. Volrath asked what type of lighting would be used on the site.

Mr. Lee stated there was no parking lot lighting in the original plan or on the Major Site Plan to be reviewed at the next meeting.

Mr. Feverston explained noticing of residents with 500 feet for projects requesting variances which is an exception of the zoning standards. Public meetings are simply noticed on the website and posting places throughout the City. He did advise Mr. Volrath the City would notice him of future meetings concerning the LA Tan project. Mr. Feverston stated the reason the plumbing plans were not available was because the building permit was for the building shell only and interior construction plans were to be submitted at the time the project moved to that phase.

Ms. Miller requested Mr. Apple prepare a revised phasing schedule for the project and submit it to the Planning Department as soon as possible.

MOTION: Mr. Garrett moved to approve Application #97 Minor Site Plan submitted by Tom Otachel/Sona Centerville LLC for properties located at 235 and 255 West Franklin Street subject to the following conditions:

1. The proposed parking lot and retaining wall for 235 West Franklin Street shall not be approved as a part of this minor site plan. The entire parking lot for both 235 and 255 West Franklin Street shall be reviewed by the Board of Architectural Review as a part of the Major Site Plan filed by the Applicant.
2. The proposed privacy fence shall be constructed having the finished side facing outwards in accordance with Section 9.39 E of the Unified Development Ordinance.
3. A performance bond or letter of credit in the amount of \$13,200 shall be posted by the developer for all required landscape and screening improvements in accordance with Section 9.25 C of the Unified Development Ordinance.
4. The proposed curbing along the north property line shall be constructed as a part of the proposed landscape bufferyard subject to approval by the City Planner.
5. A revised construction schedule shall be submitted by the developer subject to approval by the City Planner.

Mrs. Stebbins seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 5-0.

Heart of Centerville Business Association - Temporary Signs

Mr. Lee stated he had been in contact with representatives from the Heart of Centerville Business Association which is hosting a series of events on the third Friday of each month throughout the summer. Their request is to allow temporary signs to be displayed for a period of 5 days prior to each event on each participating property in the APD.

The members encouraged the Association to use other avenues to advertise the events in order to scale down the use and number of the temporary signs to be displayed. Further, the only businesses to display a sign are those participating in the event.

POLL OF MEMBERS

Mr. Treffinger asked the status of the LA Fitness project at Far Hills Avenue and Alex-Bell Road.

Mr. Feverston stated the facility is scheduled to open in the middle of this month.

Mr. Holloway indicated he would not be in attendance for the July 7, 2009 meeting.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.