

Heidi M. Miller 2/20/07

BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
Regular Meeting
Tuesday, October 17, 2006

Ms. Miller called the meeting to order at 7:30 P.M.

Attendance: Ms. Heidi Miller, Chairman; Mrs. Martha Sheley; Mrs. Laverne Stebbins; Mr. James Treffinger; Mr. Jaime Garrett; Mr. Alok Khare. Absent: Mr. Charles Graham. Also present: Mr. Ryan Lee, Planner.

Excuse Absent Members:

MOTION: Mr. Treffinger moved to excuse Mr. Graham from the meeting as he gave prior notice to staff. Mrs. Sheley seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 6-0.

Approval of minutes:

MOTION: Mrs. Sheley moved to approve the Board of Architectural Review Regular Meeting minutes of August 15, 2006, as written. Mrs. Stebbins seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 6-0.

COMMUNICATIONS

Mr. Lee informed the members that Council had approved the amendment to the Zoning Ordinance allowing HardiPlank as a permitted siding material on some buildings with the Architectural Preservation District (APD).

NEW BUSINESS

Mulay, David - Board of Architectural Review Special Approval

Mr. Lee reviewed the Board of Architectural Review Special Approval application submitted by David Mulay for property located at 31/33 West Franklin Street in the Architectural Preservation District (APD). The request is to create an outside stairway access to the second floor on the rear of the building and rebuild the front porch. The building currently houses Jenna Claire Handbags and Vintage Scout Interior Decorating. The applicant is proposing to create an access by opening up a door area into the existing landing area to allow access to the second tenant space on the upper level. An existing window will be removed and that wall opening will be extended for the door. The proposed porch addition will be consistent with the existing porch structure and will be repaired with a new concrete slab and refinished. Access from the porch will remain to the front sidewalk and the drop off area.

Staff recommended approval of the Special Approval application subject to the following condition:

1. Exterior materials to be used on the front porch shall be subject to approval by the City Planning Department.

Mr. David Mulay, applicant, stated the stairway access will provide fire safety to the second floor as both businesses do not always maintain the same hours of operation. Also with the rear parking, it will create better access in that area rather than having to travel to the front of the building.

MOTION: Mr. Treffinger moved to approve the Board of Architectural Review Special Approval application submitted by David Mulay for property located at 31/33 West Franklin Street subject to the following condition:

1. Exterior materials to be used on the front porch shall be subject to approval by the City Planning Department.

Mr. Garrett seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 6-0.

Mulay, David - Board of Architectural Review Special Approval (Demolition)

Mr. Lee reviewed the Board of Architectural Review Special Approval application submitted by David Mulay for property located at 59 West Franklin Street in the Architectural Preservation District (APD). The request is to demolish the existing garage structure situated at the rear of the property.

The purpose of the request is to provide more parking for the area businesses as well as conjoin the parking along West Franklin Street to eliminate some of the access points along the roadway. The garage structure was constructed between 1930 and 1940 and does not have any historic significance to the APD. Given the location of the garage structure, it does not contribute to the streetscape along West Franklin Street. Based on the location of the structure impeding on a major community improvement and being the joint parking area to service the businesses along West Franklin Street, staff recommended approval of the demolition request subject to the following condition:

1. The Board of Architectural Review (BAR) shall approve the demolition request as well as waive the three (3) month demolition delay period.

Mrs. Sheley asked how the garage structure was being used at the present time.

Mr. David Mulay, applicant, stated the garage is vacant at the present time. The property in question, and the property located at 63/65 West Franklin Street, will maintain a parking easement to provide parking spaces for those locations should the properties have separate ownership at some point in time.

MOTION: Mrs. Stebbins moved to approve the Board of Architectural Review Special Approval application submitted by David Mulay to demolish a garage structure located at 59 West Franklin Street subject to the following condition:

1. The Board of Architectural Review (BAR) shall approve the demolition request as well as waive the three (3) month demolition delay period.

Mr. Khare seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 6-0.

Century 21 - Board of Architectural Review Special Approval

Mr. Lee reviewed the Board of Architectural Review Special Approval application submitted by Tom Fitzgibbon for Century 21 located at 211 West Franklin Street in the Architectural Preservation District (APD). The request is seeking approval of an existing shed structure located at the rear of the property. Due to the plastic material of which it is composed, the BAR must specifically approve it. The styling and details of the building are fitting for the APD. It was staff's opinion that the shed itself does not necessarily pose a threat to the architectural context of the APD. He stated that although plastic is not a permitted material, staff based its recommendation on the vinyl fence the Board approved located at the rear of a property along East Franklin Street with the visibility similar to that of the property in question. Staff, therefore, recommended approval of the Special Approval application as submitted.

Mrs. Sheley asked when the shed was installed.

Mr. Lee stated the shed was installed approximately six (6) weeks ago when the business first relocated to the building not understanding the approval process.

Ms. Miller questioned the amount of the visibility of the shed from West Franklin Street.

Mr. Lee stated it was currently visible if you are looking for it, however, once the Gallatin Dental building is constructed directly to the east of the property in question, the shed should be concealed.

Ms. Miller stated that although the shed structure has some of the design standards consistent with the APD, there is concern of its plastic material. She reminded the members that Special Approval applications must be considered on an individual basis as to whether those projects are appropriate for the APD.

Mr. Garrett stated since the structure is temporary in nature, he did not object to it.

Mrs. Sheley stated she did not feel this type of plastic structure was appropriate for the APD.

Mr. Khare stated if the shed was not visible from West Franklin Street after the Galatin Dental building was complete, he would not object.

Mr. Garrett reconsidered his previous statement, stating that this shed structure would be visible from the parking lots at the rear of these properties and perhaps should maintain the design standards as it will be more prominent than initially thought.

Mr. Lee stated the Board could consider a condition to install plantings to screen the shed as an option.

Mr. Treffinger was concerned that more of these types of structures would be located in the APD if this one would be approved.

MOTION: Mrs. Sheley moved to deny Application #BAR-06-58 submitted for Century 21, 211 West Franklin Street, requesting approval of a plastic shed structure. Mr. Khare seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 6-0,

OTHER BUSINESS

Mr. Lee stated that Square One, One North Main Street, started renovations on the building. The existing aluminum siding on the back portion of the building has become impossible to repair as many pieces are missing. The applicant is seeking approval to use HardiPlank on this addition to the original structure. Mr. Lee stated the City Council has indicated they will amend the Zoning Ordinance to allow HardiPlank material on specific applications. He stated the use of HardiPlank, as proposed, would be consistent with the intent of the pending ordinance.

The members had no objection to the use of HardiPlank in this application as it would meet the intent of the pending ordinance.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.