

BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
Regular Meeting
Tuesday, April 2, 2002

Mr. Treffinger called the meeting to order at 7:30 P. M.

Attendance: Mr. James Treffinger, Chairman; Mr. Charles Graham; Mrs. Laverne Stebbins; Mrs. Martha Sheley; Mr. Paul Clark; Mr. Jack Gramann (where noted). Absent: Ms. Heidi Miller. Also present: Mr. Ryan Shrimplin, Planner.

Motion to Excuse:

MOTION: Mrs. Sheley moved to excuse Ms. Miller from the meeting as she gave prior notice of here absence to staff. Mr. Graham seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 4-0.

Approval of Minutes:

MOTION: Mr. Graham moved to approve the December 4, 2001, Board of Architectural Review meeting as written. Mr. Clark seconded the motion. The motion was approved 3-0-1 with Mrs. Sheley abstaining.

MOTION: Mr. Graham moved to approve the February 19, 2002, Board of Architectural Review Work Session as written. Mr. Clark seconded the motion. The motion was approved 3-0-1 with Mrs. Sheley abstaining.

COMMUNICATIONS

Mr. Shrimplin informed the members of applications to be reviewed on April 16, 2002. The first application will be a building addition and remodeling of the former Friendly's Restaurant, 101 South Main Street, for a physician office. The second application is a request for a deck, ramp and fencing at 33 West Franklin Street, the foreign language school.

Work continues on the preparation of legislation to satisfy the requirements to gain the status of Certified Local Government.

Mr. Shrimplin stated he spoke with Ms. Miller concerning the BAR Sign Color Chart. She indicated new color palettes have been ordered and should be available for review in the near future.

Mr. Gramann arrived at this time.

NEW BUSINESS

DT Design - Demolition of Garage

Mr. Shrimplin reviewed the Special Approval application submitted by David T. Beyerle requesting demolition of the garage structure at 49 West Franklin Street located in the Architectural Preservation District (APD). The garage is in a state of substantial deterioration with significant wood rot on the exterior due to peeling paint. The fascia board on the north elevation has detached from the structure and is dangling. There are holes between the walls and

the roof, allowing moisture penetration of the framework. The structure has settled, weakening the entire frame system, especially the rafters, and the roof is severely warped. The applicant has been contacted by the City regarding these property maintenance violations and, in response, he is requesting to demolish the structure located at the rear of the property.

In order to grant approval of the demolition, the BAR must be satisfied that the building meets at least one (1) of the following criteria: health and safety hazard; deterrent to major community improvement; rehabilitation not economically feasible; and, detriment to community.

Staff concluded of the four (4) criteria to be considered, the rehabilitation of the building is not economically feasible. The structure currently violates the City's property maintenance code. In order to bring the structure into compliance with the code, the applicant would be required to remove and replace all rotting boards, stabilize the structural frame, replace the rotted fascia board, prep and repaint the exterior, and potentially reconstruct the roof. Staff has requested a cost estimate of the stated scope of work from the applicant. Given the extent of the damage to the siding and fascia, a substantial number of the boards would have to be replaced with boards that are custom milled to match the "novelty" siding at a significant cost. If the roof is required to be replaced, the cost will be substantial for an uninhabitable, accessory structure. Staff believes such costs will not allow the applicant a reasonable economic return on his investment.

Based on the staff analysis, the Planning Department recommended approval of the demolition request subject to the following condition:

1. The BAR waive the three (3) month demolition delay period as required in the Zoning Ordinance.

Mr. Dave Beyerle, applicant, stated he planned to construct a new structure providing possible mixed uses rather than renovate a garage space that would remain a storage space and not be economically feasible.

Mrs. Martha Boice, 7712 Eagle Creek Drive, stated the garage is located in the National Register District which consists of two early plats--Robbins Plat and Nutt Plat. She stated that when she toured the building the saw marks on the rafters were not circular which would indicate the structure was constructed prior to 1890. The concrete on the foundation was most likely applied over the original foundation material for a repair. Mrs. Boice pointed out that should repairs be made to the building, a tax credit could be issued by the Secretary of Interior. She stated if contributing buildings are removed from the District, the fabric of it will be lost.

Mr. Clark asked if the building had any historic significance.

Mrs. Boice felt the structure was originally a barn that was converted into a garage.

Mrs. Boice asked that the applicant work with the City to allow the required maintenance be satisfied with simply a coat of paint to preserve the building. She felt the structure was originally a barn that was converted into a garage.

Mr. Beyerle felt the structure was not that old and it was built by the former property owner. He ran a cable from one end to the other as tension to hold the building together.

Mr. Gramann felt the demolition should be approved and the three (3) month waiting period should be waived.

Mr. Clark asked if the City held accessory structures to a lesser standard.

Mr. Shrimplin indicated that any principal or accessory building in the City receives the same consideration and review process to determine historic significance for buildings which are the subject of demolition requests. To rehabilitate the building, all rotting boards would have to be removed and replaced; it would require removing the old paint, priming and repainting; and, it would have to be braced in order to stabilize it structurally.

MOTION: Mr. Graham moved to approve application number BAR-02-13 submitted by Dave Beyerle requesting the demolition of the garage structure at the rear of 49 West Franklin Street subject to the following condition:

1. The three (3) month waiting period to issue a demolition permit shall be waived.

Mr. Gramann seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 6-0.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

James L. Freyberger, Chairman

