

**BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
REGULAR MEETING
Tuesday, February 6, 2001**

Mr. Treffinger called the meeting to order at 7:30 P. M.

Attendance: Mr. James Treffinger, Chairman; Mr. Paul Clark; Ms. Heidi Miller; Mrs. Martha Sheley. Absent: Mr. Charles Graham; Mr. Jack Gramann; Mrs. Laverne Stebbins. Also present: Mr. Ryan Shrimplin, Planner.

Excuse Absent Members:

MOTION: Mrs. Sheley moved to excuse Mr. Graham, Mr. Gramann, and Mrs. Stebbins from the meeting as each gave prior notice to staff. Ms. Miller seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 4-0.

Approval of Minutes:

MOTION: Mr. Clark moved to approve the minutes of the December 5, 2000 regular meeting as written. Ms. Miller seconded the motion. The motion was approved 1-0-3 with Ms. Miller, Mrs. Sheley, and Mr. Treffinger abstaining.

MOTION: Mrs. Sheley moved to approve the minutes of the January 16, 2001 work session as written. Mr. Clark seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 4-0.

Communications

Mr. Shrimplin reminded the BAR members to submit their resume information to the Planning Department for inclusion in the Certified Local Government application.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

Demolition Application/Landmark Review - 230 West Franklin Street

Mr. Shrimplin reviewed the Demolition Application submitted by Franklin Street Baptist Church for the house located at 230 West Franklin Street on the church property. The church is planning a major building expansion and believes the house obstructs planned parking and circulation aisles. Per the City's Landmark Ordinance, the Planning Department is required to review any application for demolition to determine whether the building or structure has potential to become a designated Landmark. The Planning Department found that the house is a potential Landmark, thus triggering the Landmark review process.

The architectural firm of Reed Doran Associates was hired by the City to provide a historical and structural analysis of the house. In the report, Reed Doran identified the house as a Craftsman bungalow circa 1920's. There are several architectural features that contribute to this style: porch integrated into the house, vertical divisions in the upper window sills with a single pane below, exposed roof members, and cantilevered walls. Structurally, the house is stable with the damage being limited to water penetration due to a missing roof flashing near the dormer window, and interior deterioration of the limestone foundation in the basement. The house was built by Rufus Pope in 1924-25. The house was sold at a Sheriff's auction in 1935 during the Depression. Franklin Street Baptist Church acquired the house and 3 acres of land in 1961.

Mr. Shrimplin reviewed the criteria for a Landmark in the Staff Analysis. The Planning Commission had recommended approval of the demolition, with the condition that a design solution be implemented that re-establishes the street edge that is currently defined by the house setback. Staff concluded that although the house is a significant example of Craftsman bungalow architecture, it lacks a meaningful historical association with a prominent person, event, or activity in the community, unlike the existing Landmarks. Therefore, Staff recommended against a Landmark nomination, and recommended that the demolition application be approved subject to the following condition:

1. The applicant shall work with the City to implement a creative design solution that maintains the spatial and architectural character of West Franklin Street.

Mr. Treffinger opened the public hearing.

Mrs. Florence Krahlung, president of the Centerville-Washington Township Historical Society, 89 West Franklin Street in Centerville, read a letter from Martha Boice, Chair of the Landmarks Committee for the Historical Society. The letter supported a Landmark nomination for the house and described the architectural features that contribute to its architectural style and value to the community. It is one of the very few Craftsman houses in the area. Photographs of the house were submitted as well.

Joy Pope Erd from Oakwood identified herself as the granddaughter of Rufus Pope. She urged the preservation of the house. The property was originally a farmstead. She gave her recollections of visiting her grandfather's farm. Rufus Pope was a member of the Centerville Baptist Church and the Centerville Civic Band. She recalls traveling by horse and wagon to his house and leaving them in the barn while attending the township school next door. Several members of the Pope family are buried in Centerville. The house is a wonderful example of Craftsman style architecture.

John Cooke, architect for the applicant, 527 Windsor Park Drive in Dayton, was in attendance to answer questions.

Ms. Miller asked Mr. Cooke if alternative designs were considered which would preserve the house. Mr. Cooke stated that such designs were considered, however, they did not satisfy fire code requirements for clearance.

Mr. Treffinger asked Mr. Cooke if the church has considered moving the house. Mr. Cooke stated that the church would be willing to donate the house to a willing recipient if the recipient paid the moving costs.

There being no further comments, Mr. Treffinger closed the public hearing.

Mrs. Sheley stated that she agrees with the Staff's findings and recommendation.

MOTION: Mrs. Sheley moved to recommend against a nomination for Landmark status, and to recommend approval of the demolition application to City Council, subject to the following condition:

1. The applicant shall work with the City to implement a creative design solution that maintains the spatial and architectural character of West Franklin Street.

Mr. Clark seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously 4-0.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

James F. Ferguson
Chairman

