

CENTERVILLE BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW (BAR)
Regular Meeting Minutes
J.V. Stone Council Chambers, 100 W. Spring Valley Road
Tuesday, April 4, 2023

Mr. Ross called the meeting to order at 5:32 p.m. and led the Pledge of Allegiance.

ATTENDANCE

Present: Chair Ed Ross, Vice Chair Joe DeMariano, Frank Holloway, Tom Ovington, and Chris Papakirk. Also present were Economic Development Administrator Joey O'Brien, City Planner Ian Vanness, Development Director Erik Collins, Staff Engineer Taylor Schindler, Benham's Grove Administrator Randy Bishop, Councilmember Duke Lunsford, and Assistant Clerk of Council Donna Fiori.

Members Absent: Richard Hoback and Joyce Ray-Brown.

EXCUSE ABSENT MEMBERS

MOTION: Mr. DeMariano made a motion to excuse Richard Hoback and Joyce Ray-Brown; seconded by Mr. Holloway. The motion passed 5-0.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Minutes of the following BAR meetings had been distributed prior to this meeting:

Regular Meeting and Work Session Minutes: March 7, 2023

Mr. DeMariano inquired about the *"lack of negative comments from the public input meeting"* discussion noted in the work session minutes. Mr. Ovington stated this discussion was about the lack of negative comments in the written feedback forms from the public input meeting. Mr. DeMariano requested the work session minutes be amended to include the lack of negative comments related to the written feedback forms.

MOTION: Mr. Holloway made a motion to approve the minutes as amended; seconded by Mr. DeMariano. The motion passed 5-0.

Mr. Ross read an opening statement.

Mr. Collins introduced the new City Planner Ian Vanness to the group.

NEW BUSINESS

P-2023-0009 – APD Exterior Improvements – Paint, Siding, and Windows
Lorenzo Bas
101 West Franklin Street

Mr. Vanness presented the staff report, providing the property description, application summary, standards of approval, staff analysis, and recommendation. The applicant proposes repainting the exterior brick façade with an approved color palette called Laurel Woods (SW 7749) which is a dark green color, replacing the existing siding with Laurel Woods colored fiber cement siding (a.k.a. hardie board), and replace all existing windows with double-hung vinyl white windows with matching grid patterns as existing windows. Mr. Vanness noted the subject property has undergone many renovations over time. The structure's current exterior has different siding and window materials on the second floor. Many of the wood windows are old and ineffective at weatherproofing the building, aiding in energy savings and overall efficiency. The original structure was built in 1886 as Centerville's first high school and ceased operating as a school in the 1930s which was then converted into a restaurant. There

have been several additions to the original structure over time. Staff recommends approval with one (1) condition.

1. Each replacement window must follow the existing grid pattern of the respective existing window.

Mr. Vanness noted the applicant was unable to attend the meeting due to a last-minute scheduling conflict.

Board members and staff discussed:

- Existing muntins and mullions.
- The desire for consistency among all windows to include a grid pattern.
- The fireplace will not be painted.
- Importance of commercial buildings having windows that provide insulation and safety.
- The difference in appearance from the original building resulting from changes over the years.
- Existing building materials
- Merits of hardie board based on having the appearance of wood, being durable, and being long-lasting.
- Spec sheet of the double-hung windows.
- Historical significance of the building.
- Disrepair of the building left from prior ownership.

Mr. Ross opened the meeting for public comment.

Brenda Badgley, 113 Jenny Lane, inquired why the owner wants to replace the windows, whether they are wood, and if they are operated by rope and pulley.

Mr. O'Brien noted the applicant has indicated the windows are not weather tight which is causing damage and is unaware of the material or operation of the existing windows.

Mr. Ross inquired of Mrs. Badgley if it would be desired for the owner to hold the windows to be removed aside in case they are wanted by the Centerville-Washington History or Landmarks Foundation of Centerville Washington Township for potential preservation. Mrs. Badley indicated yes if they were the original windows.

Matthew Fritz, 59 East Franklin Street, inquired if the replacement windows pattern will remain the same. Mr. O'Brien stated they would have the same pattern as exists.

There being no other comments, Mr. Ross called for a motion.

MOTION: Mr. Ovington made a motion to approve Application P-2023-0009 with the following one (1) condition:

1. Existing windows with a grid pattern must maintain that grid pattern and existing windows without grid patterns must include a grid pattern when replaced.

Seconded by Mr. DeMariano. The motion passed 5-0.

P-2023-0008 – Major Site Plan – Benham’s Grove
Lucas Lantz, LWC Incorporated on behalf of the City of Centerville
166 North Main Street

Mr. O’Brien presented the staff report, providing the property description, application summary, standards of approval, staff analysis, and recommendation. The city proposes to construct a new event facility on the north side of the Benham’s Grove property, renovate the Gerber House, Barn, and Cottage, increase parking, and improve landscaping and grounds. Mr. O’Brien noted these improvements are in response to Benham’s Grove Master Plan.

Mr. O’Brien detailed the following items proposed with the plan:

Parking and Site Improvements

- Additional parking (~50 spaces)
- Relocated entrance
- New and improved walking paths
- Parking lot lighting improvements
- Dredge pond
- Landscaping

Gerber House Renovations

- Replace the awning over the patio with a permanent structure (trellis)
- Construct ADA accessible patio and front entrance
- Relocate paver patio bricks
- Paint main wood façade: Dorian Gray (SW7017)
- Paint window and door trim: Gossamer Veil (SW9165)
- Paint gutters, fascia, and crown trim shutters: Urbane Bronze (SW7048) - change from the staff report
- Paint moldings and brackets: Rockwood Clay (SW2823)

Cottage

- Repair internal and external finishes
- Remove the side door
- Paint main wood façade: Dorian Gray (SW7017)
- Paint window and door trim: Gossamer Veil (SW9165)
- Paint gutters, fascia, and crown trim shutters: Urbane Bronze (SW7048) – change from the staff report
- Paint moldings and brackets: Rockwood Clay (SW2823)

Barn

- Install new roof.
- Paint wood façade: Anonymous (SW7046) – change from the staff report
- Paint trim: Gossamer Veil (SW9165) - change from the staff report

New Event Center

- 6,200 square feet
- 200-person event capacity
- Shed style “veiled” standing seam metal roof
- Glass façade facing wooded areas
- Limestone façade facing North Main Street
- Partially covered patio

All site improvements have met Unified Development Ordinance (UDO) standards and Design Review

Criteria. Mr. O'Brien noted the paint colors are earth tones with compatible trim colors, provide a balanced harmonious aesthetic, and generally meet approved color palettes.

Mr. O'Brien provided the following analysis related to the new event center. The architecture complements the district and adjacent historic buildings and does not compete with them, creates a modern and historic campus, intentional design focuses attention on the historic campus, and modern elements are veiled from the historic campus. Additionally, architectural details provide a balanced design that is appropriate to the selected architectural style, it is a contemporary take on barn/arboretum, includes traditional and modern architectural elements (standing seam metal roof, limestone façade, glass façade), and has appropriate massing.

Staff recommends approval with one (1) condition:

1. Any comments from relevant public utilities and review agencies shall be incorporated into the final construction drawings.

Mr. Ross discussed the proposed changes, the rationale for the changes, and existing facility conditions. He spoke in support of the improvements discussing the preservation of the existing buildings and his involvement in the Benham's Grove meetings.

Mr. DeMariano expressed support for the site plan, however, spoke strongly against the architectural style of the new event center noting it does not complement but competes with the historic campus and should be modified to address this. He voiced concern about setting a precedent with contemporary design and not following set standards.

Mr. Ovington spoke in support of the proposal and design, noting that architectural design should reflect the times which this does, and provided historical examples. Mr. Ovington noted it is probable that the original barn roof was standing seam metal and consideration should be given to replacing the barn roof with a standing seam metal roof like the event center to further tie the two together.

Mr. Ross opened the meeting for public comment.

Brenda Badgley, 113 Jenny Lane, spoke in opposition to the design of this event center being in the APD and on a historical campus.

Matthew Fritz, 59 East Franklin Street, spoke in opposition to the modern design of the event center noting it competes with the historic structures.

Board members and staff discussed:

- Historic elements and features included such as standing seam metal roof and limestone wall.
- The location of the event center in the back corner is intended to not compete with other structures.
- Number of people that attended the public input meeting.
- Revised guidelines now allow for a shed roof.
- Suggestions for a traditional look could include brick posts at the corners, changing roof design, and traditional windows.
- Design changes in the roof or windows would alter the ambiance, function, and form of the event center.
- Effects of architecture on the marketability of an event center.
- Differing size and scale between residential and commercial buildings.
- BAR cases are evaluated individually based on their own merits and do not set a precedent.

Mr. Papakirk inquired if a landscape strip could be added to break up the large expansive area of asphalt on the northwest portion of the parking lot. Mr. O'Brien clarified the request and confirmed this would be an appropriate condition.

There being no other comments, Mr. Ross called for a motion.

MOTION: Mr. Ovington made a motion to approve Application P-2023-0008 with the one (1) condition as recommended by staff and adding the following two (2) conditions:

- 2. Add a parking lot landscaping feature to the northwest portion of the parking lot unless otherwise not feasible.
- 3. Consider the option of replacing the barn roof with a standing seam metal roof.

Seconded by Mr. Holloway. The motion passed 4-1.

**MAYOR'S AWARD FOR PRESERVATION
NOMINATION AND DISCUSSION**

Mr. O'Brien provided a PowerPoint presentation, describing the award categories/criteria, a listing of previous winners, and a photo of the 2023 nominee. The following address was the only property nominated for consideration of the award from the BAR members during a nomination period in March.

Nominee:

- 1 North Main Street (Square One Salon)

Members discussed the merits of the nominee noting the commendable work done by Square One Salon.

MOTION: Mr. DeMariano made a motion to award the 2023 Mayors Award for Preservation to 1 North Main Street for Excellence in Restoration; seconded by Mr. Ovington. The motion passed 5-0.

COMMUNICATIONS

Mr. O'Brien spoke about:

- Invitation to City Council work session on May 1, 2023, for the annual BAR review.
- Updates on the Sweeney's building, Agave & Rye, Brunch Pub, and Manna.

The next meeting of the Board of Architectural Review will be May 2, 2023, in the J.V. Stone Council Chambers at 5:30 p.m.

ADJOURNMENT

Seeing no further business, Mr. Ross adjourned the meeting at 7:05 p.m.

Submitted By: Donna Fiori

Ed Ross
Approved – Chairperson

5/3/2023
Date