

CENTERVILLE BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW (BAR)

Regular Meeting Minutes

J.V. Stone Council Chambers

Tuesday, September 10, 2024

Mr. Ross called the meeting to order at 5:30 p.m.

ATTENDANCE

Present: Chair Ed Ross, Vice Chair Tom Ovington, Frank Holloway, James Neidhard, and Joyce Ray-Brown. Also present were City Planner Ian Vanness, Development Director Erik Collins, Municipal Attorney Scott Liberman, Councilmember Bill Serr, and Assistant Clerk of Council Donna Fiori.

Members Absent: Chris Papakirk and Richard Hoback.

EXCUSE ABSENT MEMBERS

MOTION: Mr. Holloway made a motion to excuse Mr. Papakirk and Mr. Hoback from the meeting; seconded by Ms. Ray-Brown. The motion passed 5-0.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Minutes of the following BAR meeting had been distributed before this meeting:

Regular Meeting: July 2, 2024

MOTION: Mr. Ovington made a motion to approve the minutes as distributed; seconded by Ms. Ray-Brown. The motion passed 5-0.

Mr. Ross read an opening statement.

NEW BUSINESS

**P-2024-0019 – APD Exterior Improvement – Window Molding, Trim and Fascia
John Gilson, Prime Residence Group
70 West Franklin Street**

Mr. Vanness presented the staff report displaying the property description, application summary, standards of approval, and staff recommendation. The applicant, John Gilson, on behalf of the Prime Residence Group, requests to replace the existing wood window moldings, trim and fascia with Trex PVC (hereafter composite) in the same existing style. The building has five (5) lower first-floor wall openings and six (6) second-floor wall openings that all have exterior wood trim. The first-floor wall openings are comprised of two (2) doors and three (3) windows. Each first-floor wall openings have the same exterior moldings that consist of two (2) recessed panels and light fixtures on each side of the opening, with dentils on the molding above the opening. The second-floor wall openings all have identical trims above the windows that have dentils. Only the fascia that runs along the gutters is being proposed for replacement. The fascia does not have architectural details and is primarily on the building's west elevation. The replacement of wood moldings, trim and fascia with composite requires BAR approval because it would introduce a non-traditional material where a traditional material exists.

Staff recommended approval without condition.

Mr. Vanness noted the applicant was not present at the meeting and had sent Darren Booth as their representative.

Mr. Ross discussed replacing wood with modern materials offers better maintenance and durability emphasizing that the new elements need to match the current aesthetic closely.

Mr. Ovington raised concern about the appearance of the fascia suggesting it looks too narrow and should be wider to enhance the overall appearance and better match the existing features.

Mr. Ross opened the meeting for public comment.

Darren Booth representing Prime Residence Group, 74 West Franklin Street expressed concern about the costs involved in replacing the wooden fascia with a wider option, noting that the current wooden fascia is not in bad condition and could be wrapped in a metal composite instead. This approach would be more cost-effective while still providing long-term maintenance benefits.

Mr. Ovington noted that the application specified the replacement of the fascia and not wrapping it in a metal composite.

Board members and Mr. Booth discussed suggestions, potential solutions, and challenges to achieving a wider fascia including materials, costs, and installation considerations.

Board members discussed tabling the fascia replacement decision until the next meeting, allowing time for Mr. Booth to consult with the building owner on the suggested changes to the fascia and clarification on the metal wrap material.

With no one else requesting to speak Mr. Ross called for a motion.

MOTION: Mr. Holloway made a motion to approve the request for the replacement of window molding and trim for application P-2024-0019, at 70 West Franklin Street; seconded by Mr. Ovington. The motion passed 5-0.

MOTION: Mr. Holloway made a motion to table the fascia replacement request for application P-2024-0019, at 70 West Franklin Street to the October 1, 2024, BAR meeting; seconded by Ms. Ray-Brown. The motion passed 5-0.

**P-2024-0022 – APD Exterior Improvement – Paint
Sarah Kerg, Columbia Financial Investments, LLC
60 South Main Street**

Mr. Vanness presented the staff report displaying the property description, application summary, standards of approval, and staff recommendation. The applicant, Sarah Kerg, on behalf of the Columbia Financial Investments LLC, requests to repaint the property's barn Sherwin Williams Black Magic (SW 6991 – Pantone 412C) as the base primary with Sherwin Williams Tricorn Black (SW 6258 – Pantone 412C) as the trim. The barn doors will be replaced with an oak Grille on Arch styled barn door that complies with the Design Review Criteria (DRC) Section IV: Building Design; Historic Windows, Doors and Wall Openings (p. 16). The barn is currently painted dark brown with red garage doors. The proposed color scheme does not comply with the DRC Color Chart and therefore requires BAR approval.

Staff recommended approval without condition.

Mr. Vanness noted several improvements to the property have already been approved by staff including the following:

- Roof replacement
- Installation of paver sidewalks
- Addition of paver parking spaces
- Re-grading of the driveway and back lot
- Replacement of porch columns
- Replacement of back steps
- Replacement of barn doors
- Installation of new gutters

Mr. Ross inquired about the color of the barn doors. Mr. Vanness stated that the barn doors are made of oak, matching the cedar-wrapped columns on the house.

Mr. Ovington expressed concerns about the proposed colors, noting that the design featured a white house with black shutters, contributing to its elegance. He felt that the new finish shown on the porch columns and the visibility of the parking pad detracted from the architectural integrity of the house. Mr. Ovington raised questions about the proposed base for the columns and its suitability with the house's overall architecture.

Mr. Ross opened the meeting for public comment.

Hannah Swigert, 55 South Main Street, Columbia Financial Investments, LLC, discussed the inspiration for the proposed barn color and detailed their approach to replacing the porch columns with a design reflective of the original style, blending historical accuracy with modern materials for longevity. She emphasized the cohesive design strategy that aligns with the business's identity, incorporating wood and stone elements throughout the property to align with the historical context. Ms. Swigert mentioned integrating the porch steps with a new stone look to complement the masonry columns.

Board members and Ms. Swigert discussed the overall landscape design, the porch, columns, and walkway.

Mr. Vanness discussed the review process for exterior improvements, noting that there are no specific standards governing column types or colors, allowing for some flexibility in design. Mr. Vanness stated he reviewed the application comprehensively, assessing various aspects against the architectural preservation standards. He reiterated the decision at hand was for the color change of the barn only but acknowledged the broader design concerns raised by the Board.

Board members and staff recognized the need for additional work sessions to thoroughly explore the Design Review Criteria and discuss potential changes.

With no one else requesting to speak Mr. Ross called for a motion.

MOTION: Mr. Holloway made a motion to approve application P-2024-0022, the APD Exterior Improvement request for the barn paint color at 60 South Main Street; seconded by Ms. Ray-Brown. The motion passed 5-0.

COMMUNICATIONS

Mr. Vanness spoke about:

- Mudlick Tap House groundbreaking this month at 110 West Franklin.
- Mural at 21 West Franklin Street is being installed.
- Save the date for the Miami Valley Planning & Zoning Workshop on December 6, 2024.


Mr. Holloway gave an update on Dr. Hoback.

The next meeting of the Board of Architectural Review will be on October 1, 2024, in the J.V. Stone Council Chambers at 5:30 p.m.

ADJOURNMENT

Seeing no further business, Mr. Ross adjourned the meeting at 6:34 p.m.

Submitted By: Donna Fiori


Approved – Chairperson

10/1/2024
Date