

PLANNING COMMISSION  
Regular Meeting  
Tuesday, September 27, 2016

Mr. Paul Clark called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

ATTENDANCE

Present: Paul Clark, Amy Korenyi-Both, Jim Durham, Robert Muzechuk, and Kevin Von Handorf. Also present were City Planner Andrew Rodney, Municipal Attorney Scott Liberman, Planner Mark Yandrick, Staff Engineer Alisha Burcham and Assistant Clerk of Council Julie Weaver.

Absent: Bill Etson.

EXCUSE ABSENT MEMBERS

MOTION: Mr. Von Handorf made a motion to excuse Mr. Etson. Ms. Korenyi-Both seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

No additions or corrections were noted for the minutes of the Planning Commission meeting of August 30, 2016.

MOTION: Ms. Korenyi-Both made a motion to approve the minutes of the Planning Commission meeting of August 30, 2016, as distributed. Mr. Muzechuk seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0.

OPENING STATEMENT

Mr. Clark read the Opening Statement concerning protocol for public hearings.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

Application P-2016-0029: Final Development Plan for Cornerstone Phase IV

Mr. Rodney recommended tabling the Final Development Plan and the Rezoning for Cornerstone North Phase IV for a third time to the September meeting, noting some of the issues delaying the applicant were not related directly to Phase IV at Cornerstone, and he requested more time.

MOTION: Ms. Korenyi-Both made a motion to remove from the table Application P-2016-0029, the Final Development Plan for Cornerstone Phase IV, submitted by Robert Hall of Cornerstone Developers. Mr. Muzechuk seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0.

MOTION: Ms. Korenyi-Both made a motion to table Application P-2016-0029 to the October meeting of the Planning Commission. Mr. Von Handorf seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0.

Application P-2016-0030: Rezoning for Cornerstone Phase IV

MOTION: Ms. Korenyi-Both made a motion to remove Application P-2016-0030 from the table. Mr. Muzechuk seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0.

MOTION: Mr. Von Handorf made a motion to table Application P-2016-0030, the Rezoning for Cornerstone Phase IV, to the October meeting of the Planning Commission. Ms. Korenyi-Both seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0.

Application P-2016-0038: Variances for Bufferyard Landscaping at Woodbourne Library

Mr. Rodney gave the staff presentation for the variances requested by Assistant Library Director Liz Fultz related to the expansion of the Woodbourne Library at 6060 Far Hills Avenue. He used an aerial map, a zoning map and photos to show current conditions on the 4.35 acre parcel in a B-2 zoning district. Variance #1 requested relief from the requirements of the UDO for bufferyard landscaping, mounding and screening along the east property line because a drainage ditch creates a significant steep slope in this area and makes it unsuitable for mounding. The applicant requested a modified bufferyard landscape plan that would include 20 shrubs, but omit canopy and understory trees. Variance #2 requested a modified landscaping plan along the south property line where a book return drive aisle will be located. The applicant suggested 18 shrubs to form a 4' hedge along the roadway. Mounding is not required adjacent to the commercial use to the south; the applicant requested to omit the canopy and understory trees here also.

Mr. Rodney defined unique site conditions. He noted that a gas easement thirty feet wide crossing the property splits it into a north and south section and limits the general placement of the building, the drive and plantings. A drainage ditch 7 to 10 feet deep on the east and south property lines affects the suitability of areas normally used as buffers, and existing natural vegetation stabilizes the stream banks. In addition, overhead utility lines limit where trees can be placed along the south property line. Because the number of elements creating practical difficulty, Mr. Rodney suggested cutting back the brush along the creek on the east property line for Variance #1 and planting shrubs. Requiring mounding would eliminate a significant number of parking spaces and push parking to a more prominent location along Far Hills Avenue. He explained the landscaping substitutions allowed by the UDO. For Variance #2, he recommended maintaining the eleven existing trees and adding 18 shrubs. Overall, he recommended approval of the two variances with the following three conditions:

1. The proposed shrubs along the east curb line of the parking lot shall be planted to create a dense, opaque living hedge of at least four (4) feet tall at maturity. All shrubs shall be evergreen.
2. For each removal of one (1) existing tree due to damage or death along the south curb line of the book drop-off drive, three (3) new shrubs shall be immediately planted in its place.

3. Twenty-one (21) additional shrubs shall be required along the south curb line of the book drop-off drive.

Mr. Clark opened the public hearing.

Library Director Kim Senft-Paras, 111 W. Spring Valley Road, Centerville, and architect Kevin McCurdy of LWC Incorporated, 434 East First Street, Dayton, came forward to answer questions. After Mr. McCurdy stated agreement with the proposed conditions, Mr. Clark closed the public hearing.

MOTION: Mr. Durham made a motion to approve Application P-2016-0038, the two landscaping variances for 6060 Far Hills Avenue, subject to the conditions recommended by staff. Ms. Korenyi-Both seconded the motion. It passed 5-0.

#### OLD BUSINESS

Mr. Rodney encouraged Planning Commission to retable the next two agenda items submitted by Robert Hall for Cornerstone Developers to the September meeting because other matters at Cornerstone North had taken precedence.

##### Application P-2016-0031: Record Plan for Cornerstone Phase IV

MOTION: Ms. Korenyi-Both made a motion to remove Application P-2016-0031 from the table. Mr. Von Handorf seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0.

MOTION: Ms. Korenyi-Both made a motion to table Application P-2016-0031 to the October meeting of the Centerville Planning Commission. Mr. Muzechuk seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0.

##### Application P-2016-0032: Major Site Plan for the Park at Cornerstone North

MOTION: Mr. Von Handorf made a motion to remove Application P-2016-0032 from the table. Ms. Korenyi-Both seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0.

MOTION: Mr. Von Handorf made a motion to table Application P-2016-0032 to the next meeting of the Centerville Planning Commission on October 25, 2016. Ms. Korenyi-Both seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0.

#### NEW BUSINESS

##### Application P-2016-0037: Major Site Plan for La Pinata at 9555 Dayton-Lebanon Pike

Mr. Yandrick presented the staff report for the application by Marty Kelchner of MUHA Construction for approval of a Major Site Plan for La Pinata, a 4096 sq. ft. Class 1 sit-down restaurant on about 1.2 acres in a B-1 zoning district at 9555 Dayton-Lebanon Pike. Using an aerial view and photos, Mr. Yandrick showed the adjacent businesses, residential uses and the access from the west. He described the landscape requirements, the width of the sidewalk, grading, the stormwater system, pedestrian/vehicle circulation, access for fire and trash trucks,

the effect of the width of Crusader Hawthorne trees on sight distance, the need for evergreens on the west property line, lighting, architecture, and materials.

Mr. Yandrick projected the elevations and pointed out the need for greater architectural detail, recommending the vertical columns and corners be faced with stone and that the arched faux windows be recessed. Mr. Durham agreed that the plan did not depict 4-sided architecture and suggested improvement of the public's view of the west elevation. He recommended upgrading the look of the cooler and hiding the utility boxes. Noting the gas meters could not be shielded from view, Mr. Rodney stated staff could work with the applicant to create a more aesthetically pleasing elevation.

After giving the staff analysis, Mr. Yandrick stated staff felt the Standards of Approval could be met and recommended approval of Application P-2016-0037, subject to the following nine conditions:

1. A landscape estimate and bond (performance or cash) valid for one (1) year shall be submitted for all proposed on-site landscaping prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Zoning Compliance, if planting is not to occur prior to opening.
2. The applicant shall provide estimates for all work within the public right-of-way for bonding purposes. All work within the right-of-way shall comply with City of Centerville standards. Separate construction documents, an estimate, and bond (performance or cash) valid for one (1) year for all proposed work within the public right-of-way – including street trees, driveways, and stormwater infrastructure – shall be approved by the City Engineer.
3. Calculations, drainage area maps, and all necessary information (pre- and post-construction) shall be provided and approved by the City Engineer.
4. The sidewalk connection to the public sidewalk along Dayton-Lebanon Pike shall be adjusted to five (5) feet in width.
5. Planning Commission hereby explicitly approves the use of EIFS for the building façade as required by UDO Article 9.53(C)(2)(c)(iii).
6. The architectural plan shall be amended to recess the two faux archways on the eastern façade and three faux archways on the southern façade
7. The landscape plan shall be updated on the west landscape bufferyard to include evergreens and conifers as required by the Unified Development Ordinance.
8. The landscape plan shall be amended to include a landscape bed in the center of the parking lot, immediately west of the principal building. This landscape bed shall be designed to permit emergency and fire access to navigate the site as provided with the turn templates.
9. Construction document notes and detailed plan review comments from the Public Works Department shall be incorporated into construction plans subject to review and approval

by the City Engineer. An Ohio-licensed professional engineer is to stamp, sign, and date the plans.

Comments from Planning Commission followed. Mr. Von Handorf requested that Condition #6 be amended to include the requirement for the vertical columns to be faced with stone. Mr. Durham pointed out that the north elevation with the main entrance and the service door seemed unbalanced and asked if the service door could be moved to the west elevation. Mr. Rodney suggested creating a pattern of arches or using another feature for visual interest. Because of the access road at the rear, the entire building would be easily seen and 4-sided architecture was especially important. When Ms. Korenyi-Both queried whether more specifics about landscaping should be included with the Condition #7, Mr. Rodney stated staff would continue to work with the applicant.

Mr. Clark opened the public hearing and asked the applicant about the proposed conditions. Mr. Marty Kelchner of MUHA Construction, 855 Congress Park Drive, stated he would continue to work with staff to address the issues presented. Mr. Durham thanked him for the cooperation with staff in making changes from the original submittal.

Mr. Durham concurred with the staff suggestions and summarized his specific concerns. In addition to moving the utility door, he felt the cooler on the west side was too low and might need a parapet or some tile roof, in order to work as part of the building as a whole. In general, he wanted better aesthetics for the western third of the north elevation and overall improvement of the west elevation. Mr. Kelchner said that moving the mechanical room door to another façade would be very difficult, but he would work with staff on improving the north and west elevations. The group looked at possibilities for landscaping near the building.

MOTION: Mr. Durham made a motion to approve Application P-2016-0037, the Major Site Plan for La Pinata at 9555 Dayton-Lebanon Pike, subject to the nine conditions recommended by staff, with Condition #6 amended to state that all faux windows shall be recessed and with the addition of the following two conditions:

10. The applicant shall work with staff to improve the architectural details/expression on the west façade and the west end of the north façade.
11. The vertical elements shall be faced with stone, not EFIS.

Mr. Von Handorf seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0.

#### Application P-2016-0039: Major Site Plan for Woodbourne Library Addition

Mr. Rodney presented the staff report for the application by Kim Senft-Paras, Director of the Centerville Washington Public Library, for a Major Site Plan for the Woodbourne Library at 6060 Far Hills Avenue in a B-2, General Business, zoning district. The plan centered on a 12,300 sq. ft. expansion of the library originally designed in the early 1960's by a renowned Cincinnati architect, Woodward (Woodie) Garber. Also included were 131 parking spaces, new lighting and additional greenspace. Mr. Rodney used an aerial view, a zoning map and photos to describe the current conditions for the 4.35 acre parcel previously replatted to consolidate the sites of the Woodbourne Library, the cataloging center and the former McDonald's site. He stated the cataloging center will be demolished and the small storage building will be removed. The

presence of a major BP gasoline, a stream along two boundaries and a Zone A flood plain designation (per FEMA) were important considerations.

Saying the elements of the plan generally met the standards, Mr. Rodney discussed traffic circulation, grading, setbacks, lighting, and storm water management, before pointing out the significant history of the library building. He felt the design of the addition maintained the aesthetic of mid-century modern architecture; requiring Centerville's traditional base, body and cap features would be inappropriate. He stated the mechanicals would be screened from view, for the most part. Because of FEMA regulations, the applicant would need to meet current flood plain design standards. Staff recommended approval, subject to the following five conditions:

1. An Irrigation Plan shall be provided with the final construction documents.
2. Planning Commission hereby approves the use of metal paneling, composite materials, and glass as a base, body, and cap material in accordance with UDO Article 9.53(C)(2)(c)(iii).
3. Planning Commission hereby approves the use of a flat roof in accordance with UDO Article 9.53(C)(2)(d).
4. Prior to the approval of construction documents, the Applicant shall provide evidence the proposed site improvements adhere to Article 9.37, Floodplain Design Standards, as well as all other related state and federal regulations for floodplain development.
5. Construction document notes and detailed plan review comments from the Public Works Department shall be incorporated into construction plans subject to review and approval by the City Engineer. An Ohio-licensed professional engineer is to stamp, sign, and date the plans.

When Mr. Clark opened the public hearing, Library Director Kim Senft-Paras, 111 W. Spring Valley Road, Centerville, and Architect Kevin McCurdy of LWC, Incorporated, 434 East First Street, Dayton, came forward to answer questions. When Mr. Von Handorf inquired about the screening of the mechanicals, Mr. McCurdy stated mechanicals, painted to match the roof, would be placed in the lowest point of the roof to limit exposure. Screening would be mounted to the equipment on the south elevation, the side with the greatest exposure. Mr. Clark asked if the applicant had issues with any of the conditions, and Mr. McCurdy responded in the negative.

Mr. Durham agreed the materials should be glass and steel, but pointed out his concerns. He disliked the sloped roof of the addition. He felt a raised (higher) flat roof with strict horizontals and right angles would be more in keeping with the original work of Mr. Garber. Pointing out the hidden doorway on the current building, Mr. Durham also objected to the round shape and blue color of the new entry and stated the wood under the overhang, although beautiful, was not consistent with Garber's work. He felt preserving the architectural integrity of the building was the justification for approval of the plan, since the design was not in keeping with the base, body, and cap requirements of the Unified Development Ordinance. He complimented Mr. McCurdy on the overall site plan.

Mr. McCurdy stated the previous addition was an understated version of the original building and would be used as a center piece connecting the original building and this new section. He

explained he was not trying to recreate the original design of the building and had valid reasons for the current features.

Mr. Clark closed the public hearing.

MOTION: Ms. Korenyi-Both made a motion for approval of Application P-2016-0039, the Major Site Plan for the addition to Woodbourne Library. Mr. Muzechuk seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-0-1, with Mr. Durham abstaining.

#### Rules of Procedure

Mr. Rodney summarized the proposed changes to the Planning Commission Rules of Procedure. He noted removal of the reference to the time of meetings, in order to give the Planning Commission the flexibility to set its own schedule. He also clarified the quorum numbers and voting requirements for various types of applications were updated to reflect the requirements of the Unified Development Ordinance. Staff recommended approval of the changes.

MOTION: Mr. Durham made a motion to approve the proposed updates to the Rules of Procedure. Ms. Korenyi-Both seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0.

#### 2017 Planning Commission Submittal Calendar

Mr. Rodney explained the 2017 Submittal Calendar included both the deadlines for submittal of various types of applications and the dates for Planning Commission meetings. Planning Commission agreed to have meetings on the last Tuesday of the month except in May, October and December, where holidays interfered. The regular meeting time will be 7:00 p.m.

MOTION: After a brief discussion of the December date, Ms. Korenyi-Both made a motion to approve the 2017 Planning Commission Submittal Calendar. Mr. Muzechuk seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0.

#### COMMUNICATIONS

Mr. Rodney shared a number of items under Communications. He expected to have the Centerville Place Study for Planning Commission review in October, along with a Rezoning and a Preliminary Development Plan for The Allure apartment complex. In addition, Graceworks had submitted another amendment to the Final Development Plan for a wellness center and additional assisted living. He stated Hallmark Communities might be applying for a Chardonnay Drive development in November and announced that the Centerville-Washington Park District had purchased the Zengel property along Alex-Bell Road.

The next regular meeting was scheduled for October 25, 2016, in the Council Chambers of the Municipal Building at 7:00 p.m.

There being no further business, Mr. Clark adjourned the meeting.



Paul Clark, Chair