

PLANNING COMMISSION
Regular Meeting
Tuesday, October 25, 2016
Council Chambers
101 W. Spring Valley Road

Mr. Paul Clark called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

ATTENDANCE

Present: Paul Clark, Amy Korenyi-Both, Robert Muzechuk, and Bill Etson. Also present were City Planner Andrew Rodney, Municipal Attorney Scott Liberman, Staff Engineer Alisha Burcham and Assistant Clerk of Council Julie Weaver.

Absent: Jim Durham and Kevin Von Handorf.

EXCUSE ABSENT MEMBERS

MOTION: Ms. Korenyi-Both made a motion to excuse Mr. Durham and Mr. Von Handorf. Mr. Muzechuk seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-0.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

No additions or corrections were noted for the minutes of the Planning Commission meeting of September 27, 2016.

MOTION: Mr. Muzechuk made a motion to approve the minutes of the Planning Commission meeting of September 27, 2016, as distributed. Ms. Korenyi-Both seconded the motion. The motion passed 3-0-1, with Mr. Etson abstaining.

OPENING STATEMENT

Mr. Clark read the Opening Statement concerning protocol for public hearings.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

Application P-2016-0029: Final Development Plan for Cornerstone Phase IV
Application P-2016-0030: Rezoning for Cornerstone Phase IV

Mr. Rodney recommended tabling the Final Development Plan and the Rezoning for Cornerstone North Phase IV to the Planning Commission meeting on December 13, 2016. He stated some of the issues delaying the applicant were not related directly to Phase IV, and the applicant requested more time.

MOTION: Ms. Korenyi-Both made a motion to remove from the table Applications P-2016-0029 and P-2016-0030, submitted by Robert Hall of Cornerstone Developers. Mr. Etson seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-0.

MOTION: Ms. Korenyi-Both made a motion to retable the two applications to the Planning Commission meeting on December 13, 2016. Mr. Muzechuk seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-0.

Application P-2016-0041: Rezoning to Add Community Center Overlay to B-PD
The Allure, 6751 Loop Road

Mr. Rodney noted it would take a unanimous vote of the four members present to recommend approval of the rezoning to City Council, since a majority of the full commission was required.

Mr. Rodney gave the staff report for the rezoning requested by Jerad Barnett, President of Mills Development Showcase, Ltd., to add a Community Center Overlay to the 14.5 acre former site of Showcase Cinemas to permit an apartment complex in the B-PD, Business Planned Development zoning district. Mr. Rodney used a zoning map, aerial view and photos to describe the existing conditions. The Community Center Overlay would not directly limit density, but building height, parking, setback, landscaping, stormwater management, buffers and other requirements would determine density for the site. The applicant requested about 22 units per acre (324 apartments). The development would have a pedestrian connection to Cross Pointe Shopping Center. Mr. Rodney stated the use was appropriate and complementary to the existing businesses in Cross Pointe. Also, it was consistent with the land use principles of *Create the Vision*. Since the application generally met the standards of approval for a rezoning, staff recommended approval of Application P-2016-0041.

When Mr. Clark opened the public hearing, Mr. Jerad Barnett, President and CEO of Mills Development, 3500 Pentagon Boulevard, Beavercreek, introduced his company using slides to show examples of area projects completed by Mills Development, including buildings for Kettering Health Network and Dayton Children's Hospital. He stated the company would build, manage and maintain The Allure complex in partnership with Hills Properties which has extensive experience in apartment construction and management. The two will be co-owners and manage the complex over the long-term.

Mr. Michael Copfer, Land Acquisition and Development Manager, Hills Properties, 4901 Hunt Road, Cincinnati, stated his company had a solid history of constructing residential homes and high quality apartments communities nationwide, using the best principles in the industry. He listed awards won by the firm and affiliations with building associations. He noted Hills Properties continued to own and maintain The Reserves, Miller Farms, and Mallard Landing in the local area, since building them in the 1990's. He stated most of the lease holders were expected to be millennials or empty-nesters who were renters by choice. In describing the buildings, he said all would have elevators, some in-building parking, safety and high quality amenities. Apartments of this type were an important element of a municipality's housing stock, since they allowed for the life cycle of its residents. He noted his company took pride in adding new life to neighborhoods by infilling urban sites.

Mr. Barnett added comments about the project's compatibility with the principles of *Create the Vision*. He stated The Allure would be a well-connected, high quality neighborhood with pedestrian experiences and opportunities for community gatherings. He reiterated the multi-family complex would attract young professional residents. He shared a letter of support from Gayle Wright of Cross Pointe Center and stated some access easements tying the two properties together were already completed.

Gayle Wright of Don Wright Realty, 433 Windsor Park Drive, representing Cross Pointe Shopping Center, stated her support for the concept and the developers. She felt the apartments would be a positive influence for the shopping center, the neighborhood and the City of Centerville. She promised cooperation in making the project successful.

Mr. Clark closed the public hearing.

Mr. Muzechuk asked about the price range for the rentals and the ratio of 1 to 2-bedroom apartments. Mr. Copfer stated rentals were expected to be comparable with prices in other areas of the state—\$900 to \$1250 per month for a 1-bedroom and \$1200 to \$1590 for 2-bedroom units. He stated demand was generally greater for two bedrooms.

MOTION: Ms. Korenyi-Both made a motion to recommend that Council approve the rezoning request to add a CC, Community Center, Overlay to the B-PD, Business-Planned Development, zoning at 6751 Loop Road. Mr. Muzechuk seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-0.

P-2016-0042: Preliminary Development Plan for The Allure, 6751 Loop Road

Mr. Rodney presented the staff report for the Preliminary Development Plan for 6751 Loop Road for the construction of a 324-unit multi-family complex with seven 4-story buildings on the 14.5 acre property. Density would be about 22 units per acre. Mr. Rodney used photos to show existing conditions and pointed out the detention basins, before explaining the process for approval of developments plans, reviewing the history of the parcel and describing the plan. The proposal included 655 parking places, connectivity to Cross Pointe Center, ingress and egress points onto Loop Road, possible consolidation of two detention basins into one, significant greenspace and landscaping. Mr. Rodney pointed out the need for additional work on drainage issues, access for fire trucks, and buffers. The traffic impact study was not yet available and could result in changes to the plan. He noted the access roadway behind Cross Pointe Shopping Center will remain an active traffic lane. In exchange for increased density, the UDO required high quality architectural details; specifics elements will be defined in the Final Development Plan. Staff agreed with the applicant that the plan was consistent with the principles of *Create the Vision*. Because the Preliminary Development Plan generally met the standards, staff recommended approval of the PDP, subject to the following eight (8) conditions:

1. The adoption of a Preliminary Development Plan for a multi-family development on the subject property is contingent on the approval for a rezoning to CC, Community Center, Overlay District in Case P-2016-0041.
2. Per Article 9.47 of the UDO, parkland dedication is required. The Applicant shall provide 2.76 acres of parkland via land dedication, payment of a fee-in-lieu, private open space, or a combination thereof.
3. Appropriate bicycle parking shall be provided.
4. Exterior elevations shall include a mixture of quality, durable materials arranged in an aesthetically pleasing manner to achieve a measure of style and class for the development.
5. The Applicant shall provide a Traffic Impact Study at the Final Development Plan stage

to calculate trip generation expected by the proposed development and any recommendations of the TIS shall be incorporated into the Final Development Plan at the discretion of the City Engineer.

6. The final design of stormwater management infrastructure shall be in accordance with Article 9.35 of the UDO.
7. Detailed comments from the Engineering Division will follow and shall be incorporated into the Final Development Plan, record plan, and construction documents as appropriate subject to approval by the City Engineer.
8. Detailed comments from Montgomery County Water Services and utility companies will follow and shall be incorporated into the Final Development Plan, record plan, and construction documents as appropriate subject to approval by the City Engineer.

When Mr. Clark asked about the scope of the traffic study, Mr. Rodney stated staff requested the developers for the proposed Chardonnay project and the Loop Road project work together on a traffic impact study that would include Alex-Bell Road, Loop Road, Cloyo Road and SR 48. When Mr. Etson asked that recommendations for access points for The Allure be included in the study, Mr. Rodney stated access points, turn lanes and stacking lanes on Loop Road near Versailles Drive will be part of the study.

Mr. Clark opened the public hearing.

Mr. Jerad Barnett, President and CEO of Mills Development, 3500 Pentagon Blvd., Beavercreek, mentioned the careful consideration put into the plan to date. When Mr. Clark inquired if Mr. Barnett had issues with any of the conditions, Mr. Barnett responded in the negative. Mr. Etson asked about the dog park/stormwater detention area and other possible uses for the area. Mr. Barnett stated the lot sloped to the southwest where engineers were discussing a single detention area for the entire parcel. Appropriate landscaping would be included.

Mrs. Alisha Burcham, Staff Engineer, asked that significant concerns of the Centerville Engineering Department be made part of the record of the proceedings. She pointed out the need for more study of the feasibility of the number and location of curb cuts along Loop Road, because stacking lanes would be required. The curve of the bridge over I-675 and the frontage mounding and landscaping might limit sight distance. The Engineering Department also had reservations about the plan for collecting all stormwater on the southwest corner of the parcel. Currently, water from the two separate detention ponds flows to two different receiving tributaries. Discharging all the water in one direction would require studying the effect of such a discharge on the areas downstream. Mrs. Burcham also pointed out it was unknown whether the current detention pond on the east end of the Showcase property received any stormwater from Cross Pointe Shopping Center. She stated she wanted to be clear that the Engineering Department was not approving the placement of curb cuts or detention areas at this time.

Mr. Clark closed the public hearing and asked if any modifications of the conditions were needed. Mrs. Burcham and Mr. Rodney discussed whether the current language was sufficient. Mr. Etson brought up differences between traffic generated by the cinema and the apartment traffic. Mr. Rodney said Condition #5, as written, would cover the results of the traffic impact study.

MOTION: Ms. Korenyi-Both made a motion to recommend approval to City Council of the Preliminary Development Plan for The Allure, subject to the eight conditions recommended by staff as shown above. Mr. Muzechuk seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-0.

Application P-2016-0043: Variances for Use of Colored Images
Electronic Sign at Freddy's Frozen Custard and Steakburgers, 5501 Wilmington Pike

Mr. Rodney gave the staff report for the request by Steve Weeks of Tri-State Signs for a variance to use colored images on the ground-mounted electronic message center at the corner of Whipp Road and Wilmington Pike in a B-PD zoning district. Wilmington Pike is designated a "thoroughfare" on the Thoroughfare Plan. The sign, as installed, was capable of projecting full color images and video. However, the Unified Development Ordinance limited electronic messages to a single-color copy on a single-color (usually black) background. The applicant requested to display full color images in a manner which would meet all other regulations of the UDO. The restaurant's sign was eight feet tall, set back ten feet from the right-of-way. Mr. Rodney projected pictures contrasting the requested display and the single color currently permitted. He showed other electronic message centers in Centerville and discussed the overall controls of the UDO. In looking at practical difficulty and hardship, he saw little other than economic consequences. He recommended denial of the variance and said it would be appropriate to address the regulation of electronic message centers in an update of the Unified Development Ordinance.

Mr. Clark opened the public hearing.

Matt Saunders, RGT Foods, 6389 N. Quail Hollow Road, Memphis TN, represented the applicant and requested approval of the variance. He felt the use of colors created a better advertisement for the client who wished to use the available technology. He stressed the company would abide by the decision of the Planning Commission and had already shut down the video messaging.

MOTION: Ms. Korenyi-Both made a motion for approval of the variance to use colored images on the sign at Freddy's Custard and Steakburgers, 5501 Wilmington Pike. Mr. Muzechuk seconded the motion. The motion failed in a 2-2 vote. Mr. Etson and Mr. Clark voted no.

Application P-2016-0040 Amendment Two to the Approved Final Development Plan
Bethany Lutheran Village, 6451 Far Hills Avenue

Mr. Rodney presented the staff report for the application submitted by Jeff Van Atta of Van Atta Engineering, Inc., on behalf of Graceworks Lutheran Services. He noted the Final Development Plan was amended earlier this year to include additional parking along Far Hills Avenue. He used a zoning map, an aerial view and a site map to discuss the plan to demolish the southwest wing of the Linden House and build 90,000 square feet of assisted living (74 units). Also included in the plan is a wellness center of 1,246 square feet to be added to the Village Center building and some additional parking. The changes required a second amendment to the recently amended Final Development Plan. Overall, the upgrades add 14,600 sq. ft. of impervious area to the site. Mr. Rodney stated the standards of approval could be met and recommended approval of the application, subject to the following one condition:

1. The plan amendment shall be contingent on approval of the Major Site Plan application for the proposed building additions and parking lot (P-2016-0044).

When Mr. Clark opened the public hearing, Mr. Jeff Van Atta, Van Atta Engineering, 570 Congress Park Drive, came forward to answer questions. Planning Commission had none, so Mr. Clark closed the public hearing.

MOTION: Mr. Muzechuk made a motion to recommend approval to City Council of Application P-2016-0040, the second amendment to the approved Final Development Plan, subject to the one condition recommended by staff as shown above. Ms. Korenyi-Both seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-0.

OLD BUSINESS

Mr. Rodney encouraged Planning Commission to retable the next two agenda items submitted by Robert Hall for Cornerstone Developers to the Planning Commission meeting on December 13, 2016, as requested by the applicant.

Application P-2016-0031: Record Plan for Cornerstone Phase IV
Application P-2016-0032: Major Site Plan for the Park at Cornerstone North

MOTION: Mr. Etson made a motion to remove Application P-2016-0031 and Application P-2016-0032 from the table. Mr. Muzechuk seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-0.

MOTION: Ms. Korenyi-Both made a motion to table Application P-2016-0031 and Application P-2016-0032 to the December meeting. Mr. Etson seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-0.

NEW BUSINESS

Application P-2016-0044: Major Site Plan for Bethany Lutheran Village
Assisted Living and Wellness Center

Mr. Rodney summarized the staff report for Application P-2016-0044, filed by Mr. Jeff Van Atta of Van Atta Engineering, Inc., on behalf of Graceworks Lutheran Services, for additional assisted living, a wellness center and modified parking at Bethany Lutheran Village, 6451 Far Hills Avenue. Mr. Rodney used photos to describe the existing conditions on the property, noting the skilled nursing wing of the Linden House would be demolished and replaced with a 90,000 sq.ft. wing housing 74 assisted living units. Parking would be reconfigured, mostly to the south of the new wing with a total of 41 new or modified spaces. He projected the elevations of the assisted living wing to show an elevation change of about fifteen feet along the north side of the new wing and a dense living hedge adjoining the Kettering Foundation property to the south. The architecture of the additions showed good continuity with the original structures. After stating the standards could be met for the parking lot layout, lighting, four-sided architecture, setbacks, traffic circulation and landscaping, he recommended approval of the Major Site Plan, subject to the following seven (7) conditions:

1. Where no fence is present near the proposed additional parking, the dense, living hedge along the south property line shall be maintained. Any gaps shall be filled with new

screening vegetation or replaced with a fence, wall, or other opaque treatment.

2. Planning Commission hereby permits existing screening foliage along the south property line to count toward 30 of the required 45 evergreens.
3. Per Article 9.53(C)(2)(b)(i)(3-5), any area of flat roof on the subject buildings shall include a cornice, parapet, awning, canopy, or eaves of at minimum 8% the average wall height and be clearly distinguishable from the body via at minimum three of the following design elements: color, material, pattern, profile, and texture.
4. Per Article 9.53(C)(2)(g)(iv)(3), all doors and windows shall be articulated through the use of lintels, sills, and thresholds.
5. Per Article 9.53(C)(2)(c)(iii) and Article 9.53(C)(2)(d)(i), Planning Commission hereby approves the use of E.I.F.S. and a flat roof.
6. An approval of this Major Site Plan application is subject to City Council approval of the Final Development Plan amendment in Case P-2016-0040.
7. Construction document notes and detailed plan review comments from the Public Works Department and other review agencies shall be incorporated into construction plans subject to review and approval by the City Engineer and City Planner. An Ohio-licensed professional engineer and architect is to stamp, sign, and date the plans.

Mr. Rodney stated that the Planning Commission could strike Condition #4, since he realized that the doors and windows of the existing building were not articulated. He felt they should match.

Mr. Clark opened the public hearing.

Mr. Richard Kieley, Hodgson Architectural Group, 2312 Miramar Boulevard, University Heights, answered questions about the use of a standing seam roof and agreed with the omission of Condition #4. His company, the original architect for the Linden House, had the goal of blending the new elements with their older counterparts.

Mr. Clark closed the public hearing.

MOTION: Ms. Korenyi-Both made a motion for approval of the Major Site Plan for Bethany Lutheran Village upgrades, subject to the conditions recommended by staff as shown above, omitting Condition #4. Mr. Etson seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-0.

P-2016-0045: Major Site Plan for Eddie's Lawn and Landscaping
8431 Clyo Road

Mr. Rodney reported on the application for a Major Site Plan submitted by Eddie Bonsteel, owner of Eddie's Lawn and Landscaping, to relocate the business to 8431 Clyo Road in an I-1, Light Industrial zoning district. The single family home on the property was already being used as the contractor's office. A new 7500 sq. ft. storage building with four overhead doors and two man doors would be constructed. Eleven parking spaces were included on the plan. Mr. Rodney

used an aerial map and photos to show existing conditions. He noted much of the undergrowth would be removed to allow use of the property for Mr. Bonsteel's business. A strip of property owned by Dr. Thomas bordered Clio Road. The landscape/screening plan would keep existing trees, as much as possible. Mr. Rodney noted the final grading plan, drainage plan and lighting plan were still needed. The building would have standing seam corrugated siding and a metal or asphalt shingle roof. Staff recommended a stone base and an asphalt roof.

Staff recommended approval of the application, subject to the following twelve (12) conditions:

1. Per Article 9.35 of the UDO, final Grading and Stormwater Management Plans shall be approved by the City of Centerville prior to construction.
2. Per Article 9.27 of the UDO, a final Lighting Plan shall be approved by the City of Centerville prior to construction.
3. A Utility Plan shall be required to show existing and proposed new utility connections.
4. A Stormwater Pollution Prevention Plan shall be provided that addresses erosion control during construction.
5. A Sight Triangle Diagram shall be provided to show sight distances at the driveway intersection with Clio Road.
6. Per comments from the Washington Township Fire Department, an on-site turnaround and modifications to the Clio Road driveway meeting WB-50 access requirements shall be provided.
7. The parking aisle for the spaces adjacent to the new storage building is insufficient in width. Per UDO requirements, the drive aisle shall be 24 feet in width.
8. A hard, paved surface is required for all vehicle parking and circulation.
9. If the existing ash tree to be treated for EAB succumbs to the insect and is removed, a new canopy tree shall be planted along the north property line in the same approximate location.
10. The proposed rock veneer shall encircle the entire base of the storage building.
11. As required by UDO Article 9.53(C)(2)(c)(iii), Planning Commission hereby permits the use of corrugated metal for the storage building body.
12. Construction document notes and detailed plan review comments from the Public Works Department and other review agencies shall be incorporated into construction plans subject to review and approval by the City Engineer and City Planner. An Ohio-licensed professional engineer and architect is to stamp, sign, and date the plans.

Mr. Clark noted the unusual configuration of the lot, that is, the frontage owned by Dr. Thomas and the corridor along the south boundary for future access to property to the west.

Ms. Korenyi-Both pointed out the incompleteness of the application. In response, Mr. Rodney stated the applicant was not familiar with the approval process and had recently hired an architect and an engineer. He stressed staff was supportive of the project and wanted to give the applicant the opportunity to provide the needed documentation and still have a timely review.

When Mr. Clark invited the applicant to comment, Eddie Bonsteel, 104 Shadow Lake Way, Springboro, came forward to answer questions. Mr. Clark and Mr. Etson inquired about trees, one dead and one being treated for ash borer. Mr. Rodney stated Mr. Bonsteel could replace the dead tree at a different location and still meet his canopy tree requirement.

When Ms. Korenyi-Both asked Mr. Bonsteel about concerns related to the conditions, he requested to use a stone veneer on three sides of the storage building rather than four, because of the additional expense. He felt the rear of the building would not be seen. He was agreeable to installing a shingled roof. Mr. Rodney stated he would prefer to omit the stone from the elevation under the overhang on the west side. The area would be used for storage, making that façade less visible.

MOTION: Mr. Etson made a motion to approve Application P-2016-0045, the Major Site Plan for Eddie's Lawn and Landscaping, subject to the twelve (12) conditions recommended by staff, with Condition #3 amended to require a stone veneer as a base on the north, east and south elevations. Ms. Korenyi-Both seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-0.

Centerville Place Study

Mr. Rodney announced a public hearing for formal review of the Centerville Place Study would be on the agenda for the Planning Commission meeting of November 29, 2016. He requested that members submit comments to him concerning the wording, the text, the images and the arrangement of the content prior to the next meeting. Mr. Clark asked about the large dirt mound behind the shopping center. In response, Mr. Rodney stated the acreage could be developed, but the preparation of the site or removal of the hill would be costly. If removed, the area would be on an elevation similar to the homes to the west. The study showed it as future residential space.

COMMUNICATIONS

Mr. Rodney shared a number of items under Communications. In addition to the public hearing for the study, he expected the agenda for November to include a rezoning adding an overlay designation for The Lofts at Chardonnay Drive, the Preliminary Development Plan for The Lofts, a variance and major site plan for a garage on Goldengate Drive and a major site plan for a garage on Stephanie Drive. He reminded Planning Commission he was taking registrations for the Miami Valley Planning and Zoning Workshop on Friday, December 2, 2016.

The next regular meeting was scheduled for November 29, 2016, in the Council Chambers of the Municipal Building at 7:00 p.m.

There being no further business, Mr. Clark adjourned the meeting about 8:45 p.m.



Paul Clark, Chair