

BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
Regular Meeting
Tuesday, December 6, 2016

Mr. Ross called the meeting to order at 7:30 p.m. in the Council Chambers of the Municipal Building.

ATTENDANCE

Present: Ed Ross, Frank Holloway, Chris Papakirk, Brad Thorp, and Chris Von Handorf. Also present were City Planner Andrew Rodney and Assistant Clerk of Council Julie Weaver.

EXCUSE ABSENT MEMBERS

Mr. Graham and Dr. Hoback had notified Mr. Rodney they would be absent.

MOTION: Mr. Holloway made a motion to excuse the absence of Mr. Graham and Dr. Hoback. Mr. Von Handorf seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

For the minutes of May 3, 2016, Mr. Papakirk corrected the address of his property in Centerville from 2 W. Franklin Street to 4 W. Franklin Street.

MOTIONS: Mr. Holloway made a motion to approve the minutes of the Board of Architectural Review of May 3, 2016, with the correction of the address as noted. Mr. Papakirk seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0.

NEW BUSINESS

Application P-2016-0051: Rehabilitation of the Carriage House at 36 South Main Street

Mr. Rodney presented the staff report for the application submitted by Karin Gaiser for upgrades to the carriage house at 36 South Main Street in the Architectural Preservation District. Mr. Dale Hagler, the contractor with Weaver Barns and representing Ms. Gaiser, was present for the meeting. The proposal was for an extensive makeover of the carriage house with 1" x 4" vertical wood siding, new wood windows, a new man door, an additional window and three sets of faux double doors. The existing roof would remain. Mr. Rodney used an aerial map and photos to show existing conditions on the property. He went through the proposed changes, elevation by elevation. He stated the upgrades were tasteful and consistent with existing features of the building. The color palette could be approved later by staff as long as the hues chosen were on the approved color chart.

The Planning Department recommended approval of the application with the following one condition:

1. The existing driveway shall be removed or repaired.

When Mr. Thorp asked if the man door was the single ingress and egress point, Mr. Hagler answered in the affirmative and noted the owner now was requesting that the three sets of faux double doors be working doors, although the additional cost was significant. Each set would be six feet—not wide enough to function as garage doors, since the wood floor did not meet the standards for a garage floor.

Mr. Ross asked about the sag in the back wall and asked if the foundation would be shored up. Mr. Hagler stated the foundation would be checked, the old floor boards would be removed and fillers would be added as needed to level the floor. When Mr. Ross asked if the building could be used as a business, Mr. Rodney noted parking was very limited.

MOTION: Mr. Thorp made a motion for approval of Application P-2016-0051 for the remodeling of the carriage house at 36 S. Main Street, subject to the one condition recommended by staff. Mr. Holloway seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0.

Application P-2016-0055: Roof Replacement for 39 W. Franklin Street

Mr. Rodney presented the staff report for the removal and replacement of roofing at the historic Joseph Vorhees House built in 1827 at 39 West Franklin Street, as requested by Mr. Mike Gallagher, contractor for Todd and Andrea Burkart of J.C. Sunshine Properties, LLC. Because the current metal roof was in poor condition, Mr. Gallagher requested to remove it and the underlying wood shakes, replacing the roofing with dimensional asphalt shingles. The fascia and gutters would also be redone. With winter coming, timing was important to securing the building until spring. Other repairs were needed, but, to expedite the process, a second application would be submitted to cover other exterior items.

Mr. Rodney shared photos of the current conditions on the site. Staff did not object to the use of the dimensional shingles and felt the materials were consistent with the architecture of the building and the *Design Review Criteria* for the Architectural Preservation District. He recommended approval of the current application, subject to the following one condition:

1. All roof protrusions for HVAC and other mechanical systems shall be painted to blend with the roof color.

Mr. Rodney also noted a sagging side porch that needed repair (new posts and fascia) prior to re-roofing for the most efficient order of work, but no plan was submitted for the porch.

Mr. Mike Gallagher commented on the general condition of the house; it had been vacant since 2011. Utilities were turned off long-term and now mold needed remediation. He noted other problems both inside and outside the house. He stated a new metal roof would be significantly more expensive than dimensional asphalt shingles. He said the fascia boards would be cleaned

up or replaced, and new gutters would move water away from the house, rather than to the sump pit. He discussed the condition of the back porch and the need to repair or remove it.

The Board of Architectural Review members discussed the porch. Mr. Holloway stated it seemed appropriate to do all the repairs related to the roof at one time. To facilitate the rehab, Mr. Ross suggested the plan for the porch be approved by the City Planner, if the contractor wished to include it with the current work. Upon question from Mr. Von Handorf, Mr. Rodney stated the porch was open, and the design would be straightforward.

Mr. Gallagher requested the use of caps on the unused chimneys to eliminate water collecting in them and adding to the mold problems in the house. The Board had no objections.

MOTION: Mr. Thorp made a motion to approve Application P-2016-0055, subject to the condition recommended by the City Planner, as shown above, and the following second condition:

2. The side porch may be repaired prior to work on its roof, subject to the submittal of a plan and its approval by the City Planner.

Mr. Holloway seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0.

2017 Board of Architectural Review Submittal Calendar

Mr. Rodney presented the following Submittal Schedule with deadlines and meeting dates for 2016:

<u>Application Deadline</u> (Due at Noon)	<u>Board of Architectural Review Meeting Date</u> (Held at 7 p.m. on the First Tuesday of Month except at holidays)
Thursday, December 8, 2016	Tuesday, January 3, 2017
Thursday, January 12, 2017	Tuesday, February 7, 2017
Thursday, February 9, 2017	Tuesday, March 7, 2017
Thursday, March 9, 2017	Tuesday, April 4, 2017
Thursday, April 6, 2017	Tuesday, May 2, 2017
Thursday, May 11, 2017	Tuesday, June 6, 2017
Thursday, June 15, 2017	Tuesday, July 11, 2017
Thursday, July 6, 2017	Tuesday, August 1, 2017
Thursday, August 17, 2017	Tuesday, September 12, 2017
Thursday, September 7, 2017	Tuesday, October 3, 2017
Thursday, October 19, 2017	Tuesday, November 14, 2017
Thursday, November 9, 2017	Tuesday, December 5, 2017
Thursday, December 14, 2017	Tuesday, January 9, 2018

He noted the meeting dates were the first Tuesday of the month with a week delay for the Fourth of July, Labor Day, and Election Day. The group then discussed changing the meeting time from 7:30 p.m. to 7:00 p.m. It was decided to convene at 7:00 p.m. in January.

MOTION: Mr. Papakirk made a motion to approve the 2017 Submittal Calendar as shown above. Mr. Von Handorf seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0.

COMMUNICATIONS

Mr. Rodney welcomed Mr. Papakirk to his first official meeting as a member of the Board. He thanked Mr. Von Handorf for his 3 years of service; Mr. Von Handorf had declined reappointment. The City Planner announced that Council would be appointing Mr. Tom Ovington, a retired architect living in Deer Run, to fill the vacancy.

Mr. Rodney listed a significant number of projects recently completed or ongoing in the Architectural Preservation District. He felt there was positive momentum for 2017. He mentioned that Bike Centerville, an advocacy group for bike and pedestrian friendliness, wanted to install bike racks in the downtown area. The group is associated with Bike Miami Valley.

Mr. Ross made a couple brief comments. He pointed out that Mr. and Mrs. Aukerman were very appreciative of the BAR award presented in at the June Council meeting. He also noted he attended the Miami Valley Planning and Zoning Workshop and found it highly worthwhile.

ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: Mr. Thorp made a motion to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Holloway seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0. Mr. Ross adjourned the meeting about 8:15 p.m.

The next meeting of the Board of Architectural Review is scheduled in the Council Chambers at 7: 00 p.m. on Tuesday, January 3, 2017.



Charles Graham, Chairman